I. DECLARATION OF QUORUM
A quorum being present, Chair Rainey called the meeting to order at 7:16 p.m.

II. APPROVAL OF REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF MARCH 24, 2014

Ald. Holmes moved approval of the minutes of the March 24, 2014 P&D meeting, seconded by Ald. Fiske.

The Committee voted unanimously 5-0 to approve the March 24, 2014 minutes.

III. ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

(P1) Resolution 18-R-14 Designating the Portion of Emerson Street between Asbury Avenue and Green Bay Road with the Honorary Street Name Sign, “Hecky Powell Way”

The Citizens’ Advisory Committee on Public Place Names recommends approval of Resolution 18-R-14 designating honorary “Hecky Powell Way.”

For Action

Chair Rainey moved to recommend approval of Resolution 18-R-14, seconded by Ald. Holmes.

Joe McRae, Deputy City Manager, explained that the recommendation for the street sign was made unanimously by the committee, honoring Hecky Powell and the stretch of block abutting his property on Green Bay Road. Mr. McRae said Mr. Powell has made numerous contributions to the community and that this was recommended by Ald. Holmes.

Ald. Holmes said this year is Hecky's 30th anniversary and the community is collaborating with his wife to surprise him with the honorary street name.

The Committee voted by unanimously 5-0 to recommend approval of Resolution 18-R-14.
(P2) Resolution 19-R-14 Designating the Portion of Dodge Avenue between Main Street and Lee Street with the Honorary Street Name Sign, “Crown Family Way”

The Citizens’ Advisory Committee on Public Place Names recommends approval of Resolution 19-R-14 designating honorary “Crown Family Way.”

For Action

Chair Rainey moved to recommend approval of Resolution 19-R-14, seconded by Ald. Holmes.

Mr. McRae explained that the committee recommended this designation of the 900 block of Dodge unanimously in honor of the Crown family and all their contributions to the community including the Robert Crown Center. He said this recommendation comes from Ald. Wilson with his endorsement and the Parks and Recreation Board President, Dan Stein and his wife.

Ald. Wilson said it would be a nice and an appropriate thing to do. The Crown Center and the other contributions the Crown family has made to this City have really made a significant and ongoing impact and he appreciates Mr. and Mrs. Stein making this suggestion and hopes everyone will support it.

The Committee voted unanimously 5-0 to recommend approval of Resolution 19-R-14.

(P3) Ordinance 48-O-14, Granting a Special Use for a Type 2 Restaurant, Starbucks, and a Drive-Through Facility at 1901 Dempster Street

The Zoning Board of Appeals and City staff recommend the adoption of Ordinance 48-O-14 granting a special use permit for a Type 2 Restaurant, Starbucks, and a drive-through facility at 1901 Dempster Street. The building on the property was previously a Kentucky Fried Chicken, but has been vacant for over three years. Request Suspension of the Rules for Introduction and Action by City Council on April 8, 2014.

For Introduction and Action

Ald. Wilson moved to recommend introduction of Ordinance 48-O-14, seconded by Ald. Fiske.

Mark Muenzer, Director of Community Development, reiterated that staff and the Zoning Board recommend approval and noted that the lot has been vacant for about 3 years at a key intersection of the City. Staff and ZBA agree that it meets the requirements of a special use and recommend approval with the condition that the hours are limited to 5 a.m. to midnight, 7 days a week and that the applicant comply with the litter collection and garbage pickup plan, to which they have agreed. The applicants approached the podium.

Mamie Yee, Real Estate Manager for Starbucks, said they are very excited for this opportunity for their 7th store in Evanston. She introduced the developer,
Scott Goldman, and said he has done a similar site in Naperville in exactly the same type of KFC building that was renovated. Chair Rainey said it is a perfect use since KFC restricts the users of their property to anyone who competes with any of their food groups.

At Ald. Wilson’s inquiry Ms. Lee replied that they hope to open in September or October of this year.

Chair Rainey moved to suspend the rules, seconded by Ald. Fiske.

The Committee voted unanimously 5-0 to recommend introduction and to suspend the rules for adoption of Ordinance 48-O-14.

(P4 and P5) The Plan Commission and City staff recommend the adoption of either Ordinance 47-O-14 or Ordinance 53-O-14 to grant approval of a Planned Development to construct an eight-story extended stay hotel located at 1515 Chicago Avenue. Two ordinances are presented for consideration. Ordinance 47-O-14 requires preservation of an elm tree; Ordinance 53-O-14 permits removal of an elm tree.

(P4) Ordinance 47-O-14, Granting a Special Use Permit for a Planned Development, 1515 Chicago Avenue, and Requires Preservation of an Elm Tree
Per the recommendation made by the Plan Commission, Ordinance 47-O-14 requires the applicant to preserve the existing elm tree in the rear of the property.
For Introduction

(P5) Ordinance 53-O-14, Granting a Special Use Permit for a Planned Development, 1515 Chicago Avenue, and Permits Removal of an Elm Tree
Ordinance 53-O-14 allows the applicant to remove the existing elm tree in the rear of the property, but the applicant must install a new 9-inch caliper tree in the southeast corner of the property and provide additional parking.
For Introduction

Chair Rainey explained that Ordinance 53-O-14 has to do with the same special use as 47-O-14; one requires conditions of preserving an elm tree that is in the alley and the other permits the removal of the elm tree with other requirements added to the privilege of removing the elm tree.


Mr. Muenzer summarized:
- The Planned Development (PD) site is at 1515 Chicago Avenue in a D4 (Downtown) Zoning District
• It is a proposed Hyatt extended stay hotel
• D1 and D4 Districts are to the north and south
• R6, a higher density multi-family residential district, to the east
• Raymond Park is to the south
• The applicant worked extensively with staff and the community to get to the current design, and staff is happy with it
• Brick façade with a distinctive metal cladding
• Top hat feature which has been reduced in size
• Height is within scale at 8 stories
• The 2 story base matches in scale to the historic building to the south
• Worked with applicant to include many windows and glass along Chicago Avenue to engage with pedestrian activity

Site plan:
• Adding a dining and lounge area with windows open to Chicago Avenue as a public benefit
• Business area and meeting rooms
• Three new 6” caliper trees on Chicago Avenue
• Parking for 35 spaces in rear, 34 of which are compliant and 1 compact
• Parking is accessed from the east/west and north/south alleys

Compliance with zoning:
• Height allowed is 85’, which is proposed
• FAR: 4.5 allowed; 3.49 proposed
• Seeking site development allowances for parking: a 5’ set back from property line at alley required; 0’ set back on north south and east in order to accommodate the parking needed for the site

Elm Tree Ordinances:
• 47-O-14 requires the applicant to maintain the elm tree in the southeast portion of the site; if it is retained, it would eliminate 3 of the parking spaces reducing the spaces from 34 to 31, which would require a 4th site development allowance; the applicant objects to this ordinance.
• 53-O-14 allows for the elm tree to be removed:
  o In return the applicant will plant a 9” caliper tree, which is fairly substantial, in the southeast corner of the property
  o This involves an agreement with the property owner to the south because the tree would be planted between the 2 properties and would require one of the spaces on the hotel lot to be converted to a compact space, which is not code compliant, and the property to the south
  o The variation with this ordinance is that, if for whatever reason they cannot come to an agreement with the property owner to the south, the developer would pay a fee based on the Urban Re-forestation Fund, allowing for a 3rd option
  o This Ordinance also would require a 4th site development allowance because they would reduce their parking spaces by one to 33, where 34 are required
Applicant concurs with this ordinance.

- Site is currently seeded and sodded

Public Benefits - Extensive negotiations in process

- Pay the City for the loss of 2 parking spaces during construction
- Pay the City a lump sum of $10,000 for the permanent loss of 2 on street parking spaces; using the formula recommended by staff for other PD’s and the location and usage of the meters, the amount would be $69,405
- Streetscape improvements on Chicago Avenue including three new 6” caliper street trees, larger than the existing trees
- Green roof on 2 story portion of building with a 2 year maintenance plan
- Repave the east/west alley upon completion of the PD
- Will hire Evanston residents
- Wall sign: staff believes there should be signage for the public restaurant/lounge (H Bar) on 1st floor of building
- Tree ordinances

Mr. Muenzer summarized:

- Staff and the community have worked well with the applicant
- Staff believes the PD is consistent with the surrounding zoning and land uses that currently exist there
- PD is compliant with the Comprehensive Plan and the Downtown Plan in terms of positive land use that will bring upwards of 200 people into the downtown area, patronizing restaurants and shops and contributing tax revenue to the community
- PD meets the design guidelines, primarily meet the public benefits
- PD meets the City’s PD standards and staff recommends approval.

Chair Rainey commented that it is wonderful to have a PD with a 5-0 recommendation.

Chair Rainey said there are members of the public that wish to speak. Ald. Fiske requested that the applicant speaks first.

David Reifman of DLA Piper, representing the applicant, introduced Gregg Graines of DLA Piper, Tom Blunk, developer and owner-operator, Devon Patterson, architect from Solomon Cordwell Buenz, Mike Sullivan, general contractor with Peak Construction, Luay Aboona, traffic consultant of KLOA and Mel Joya, the landscape architect from Wolff Landscape Architects. Mr. Reifman emphasized that the developer's approach was to do something as close to within code as possible, with minimal relief, in order to have a project that fit in and could move quickly through the process. No incentives were requested to this end. Mr. Reifman said they have had a good process, have made tremendous progress and commended the Plan Commission for their work on the PD.

Mr. Blunk introduced his partner, Gary Janko and said he is very excited to be there. He moved back to Evanston to raise his family and appreciates the
environmental awareness in Evanston and he is sensitive to the neighbors’ concerns. They tried to provide public benefits that were commensurate with the relief they are seeking for parking setbacks.

Mr. Blunk explained that Ordinance 47-O-14 is a “non-starter” because they cannot afford to lose even one parking spot on site. They are willing to convert one to a compact stall, but it is important for the operation of a viable extended stay hotel to accommodate parking either off site by leasing spaces in a public garage or the private garage in a nearby office building that uses spots during the day.

Mr. Blunk said over the last 5 years, they have considered a multitude of uses and they decided upon the extended stay hotel with Hyatt House, from whom they have a letter of intent. This use is under-represented in the City and the North Shore, will generate taxes and jobs, benefiting the neighborhood, and is a very light use, with the low FAR, 22% below the maximum allowed.

Mr. Blunk explained:

- Typical stay is 5+ days; a typical select service hotel has a 2+ days
- Typically professionals on assignment, for example, IT projects for the hospital or university, or auditors
- Want a home away from home, an office away from the office and social gathering amenities
- Has a greater economic spinoff to neighboring businesses than a typical hotel
- Majority of the rooms have kitchenettes, so they may do grocery shopping
- Driven by corporate budgets
- Tend not to use cars but many will use taxi service
- The project will drive from $600,000-$850,000 a year in net new real estate taxes and net hotel taxes that currently do not exist

Mr. Blunk summarized:

- Meets code except for the minor parking setback allowances
- Height and materials fit in with the neighborhood
- Will achieve LEED certification
- Product is not served in Evanston
- Guests will bring street life and economic activity
- Will bring 200 new construction jobs and 25 hotel operations jobs
- Finance-able today in marketplace

Mr. Blunk said regarding the developers:

- The two entities, Janko Group and Quadrant have 25 years of experience
- Janko Hospitality has renovated 15 hotels
- Renovated the Marriott in Naperville, Illinois that was going through bankruptcy
- Janko bought the hotel with the assistance of Peak Construction
- The $25 million gut project won the Marriott opening of the year
Mr. Blunk’s comments regarding the site:
- The loading zone where 2 parking stalls will be taken out of service is not highly used currently compared to Davis and Orrington
- They will cover the spots during construction
- For the permanent removal they offered $10,000 as budget constraints allowed, though the City requested $70,000
- The restaurant/bar will have open windows that will attract street life
- The flag does not allow signage and that is their standard
- They have asked them several times and they simply cannot allow an exception for just one hotel
- The flag has been very cooperative with altering the design of the common areas to make this site work
- As an example, Union Restaurant, has a very small, 1’ X 2’ sign and you never see the sign but people see customers in the big glass windows and go in
- He is hoping this issue will be off the table
- The outdoor terrace on the northeast corner will play off nicely with the Giordano’s patio
- The pool may or may not stay.

Mr. Blunk said regarding the elm tree:
- He would love to save the elm tree
- They have done everything they can to find a way to save it
- Construction and engineering constraints make it infeasible
- Even if they were to try, they do not think it would live
- They propose to put in the correct species of a 9” caliper tree going forward, with a 2 year maintenance plan
- The neighbor to the south is receptive to modifying their parking stall to a compact stall for the new 9” tree
- The required underground detention system will cause the loss of 5 parking stalls

Chair Rainey asked the public who wished to speak to the podium.

Virginia Beatty of 1509 Forest Avenue said the big elm tree:
- Is very large at 36” in diameter at its base and 34” in diameter at 4.5’ height
- Fits in with the neighborhood
- Presented an illustration of the tree’s location
- The elm tree is probably 150 years old
- Is in very good condition
- Could probably live for another 100 years as it has adjusted to the soil conditions there
- She is concerned about replacing with a 9” tree and how they will squeeze in the roots into the compacted soil
• She believes Green Evanston would be more interested in having a tree that could handle more carbon dioxide and produce a lot more oxygen.
• It would be rather pleasant for the hotel guests to have a nice big canopy with shade underneath, than to have a little tree that will be a baby for the next 30 or 40 years.
• The tree is located in front of a row of cars.
• There seems to be space under the tree for a pleasant place for hotel guests to stay.
• Neighbors and hotel guests would be able to look out onto a green tree with birds and squirrels rather than an alley.
• She asked the Committee to think about the size of the tree that would be replaced with something a lot smaller, when it could be a very pleasant amenity for the guests.

Michael B. Taft, President of the Evanstonian Cooperative Apartments at 1508 Hinman, overlooking the site commented:
• Lives on the 8th floor.
• Has been a construction professional since 1968 and a structural iron worker by trade.
• He is currently safety director for Taylor Woodstone Builders, a joint venture with offices in Bloomington, Minnesota and Las Vegas, Nevada.
• Company constructs primarily hotels and health care clinics.
• It rains a lot in Evanston and it would be good to have porous paving.
• Mr. Taft met last Thursday with staff and Andy Schmidt of Payne and Dolan, a major paving contractor.
• Showed illustration of the north/south alley which is very heavily impacted, degraded and poorly maintained.
• The grit caused by the deterioration ends up in the sewers.
• Tracking this material into the porous parking lot would severely impact its performance.

Mr. Taft, regarding community safety:
• This site is very dangerous.
• He asked what the construction crew would do with their cranes along the alleys.
• The crane pad would be on the west side of an existing pole, which would cause problems.
• From the north border of the alley to the north wall of the 8 story structure is approximately 29’ and you cannot come within 20’ of overhead lines with a crane, per OSHA regulations.
• The north/south dimension would be constricted 9’–10’.
• The single pole has multiple lines to the surrounding businesses.
• No crane loads may be within 20’.

Chair Rainey asked Mr. Blunk to address Mr. Taft’s concerns. Mr. Blunk said Peak Construction, voted Chicago’s contractor of the year in 2012 and 2013, has been involved in the process from the beginning, and they could not have received that designation without being safety conscious.
Mr. Taft continued:
- There is a line that goes from the pole to the tree, and the proposal is to build to the property line which means that the work will be done directly above the alley
- Neighbors are concerned if they use the 12' wide scaffolds that NWU uses it will have to project over the alley
- Do we have a safety plan at this time?
- Who is your safety director and what is the extent of his training?
- When does Peak propose to meet with the community and the City to develop a site-specific safety plan, which every one of his projects has
- Has Peak Construction built with a tower crane in such a constricted site and if so, where?

Chair Rainey said she would let staff deal with the safety issues. She advised Mr. Taft that staff is highly skilled to oversee the safety of the construction.

Mr. Muenzer explained that prior to a building permit being issued, the City, as with any project of this magnitude, has a meeting with the developer, the contractor and anyone else involved in construction to devise a construction management plan, wherein they discuss the staging of the construction, where the equipment will be, how the trucks access the property and the hours of operation. If scaffolding was required in the alley, they would certainly insure that the placement of that equipment would still allow access to the alley for the residents on the block. This has been done on previous projects such as the Mather. Chair Rainey added that in the past 15 years, Evanston has built a tremendous number of large buildings.

Mr. Taft asked that the special assessment be split 50/50 for porous paving: 50% for the developer and 50% for the neighbors. Chair Rainey said there is one porous alley in the City, on Dobson between Asbury and Ashland and it was 3-4 times the price of a normal alley with regular drainage structures. She said it works well, it is a beautiful alley and the neighbors love it and she advised Mr. Taft to arrange a meeting with the developer and the Public Works Director to discuss it. Mr. Taft said porous paving in this parking lot would significantly decrease the amount of storm retention structure needed. He added that Davis and Grove have just been repaved and there are nice clean streets all around it, and a porous surface would make it very successful. Chair Rainey advised Mr. Taft that they will need 51% of all the people abutting the alley.

Kristine Westerberg, President of the 525 Grove Condo Association’s comments:
- They have appreciated the opportunity to meet with the City and the developer on a number of issues and have had some addressed
- One remaining serious concern is the impact of the setbacks on the east and south lot lines
- Presented a slide of the proposed site plan showing the 12’ wide east alley
• The alley is highly traveled with commercial, residential and pedestrian traffic
• There are adjacent buildings on the east side of the alley that follow the 5’ setback requirement such as 500 Davis, 1516 Chicago and 1508 Chicago
• Neighbors who live right across from the proposed hotel are concerned that they would have less swing space for pulling out or flexibility for cars coming through the alley, with cars parked to the lot line
• The Heil and Heil building had a gravel lot and cars rarely came up to the lot line
• Without some time of setback, undue traffic congestion will not be prevented
• Safety in an alley is a serious concern and they would appreciate if the City would take a little more time to look into this
• They were disappointed that at the Plan Commission meeting in March, one of the commissioners suggested that “Part of urban living, one could say, is the enjoyment in having to engage in conversations and interactions with people who initially are an encumbrance to you. But upon engaging them, you realize, you know that we’re in this together and we can work this out and I’ve just had a positive interaction with a service delivery man who has apologized to me and he will be moving his car so I can get out of my parking space.”
• This is a nice scenario but it does not really always happen
• For some of the older residents, it is perhaps not the easiest thing to engage in urban interaction when they are trying to move their car
• The neighbors are requesting that the City be seriously consider the setback proposal

Ms. Westerberg said regarding the existing tree at the south lot line, the neighbors at 525 Grove:
• Understand the developer’s concerns that this is a non-starter
• Feel that this is a significant natural feature that already exists
• It should be part of the consideration for a new development
• They understand that different trees can be added at different parts of the City but
• Sustaining and preserving what we already have seems to be an important theme for the City of Evanston
• They encourage some consideration for keeping that tree, for reducing parking spaces, or at least consider porous asphalt in the parking lot, which might reduce some of the need for storm water detention

Ms. Westerberg thanked the Committee for their consideration.

Robert Mark, a clinical psychologist and a corporate consultant of 1508 Hinman’s comments:
• He and his wife purchased their unit because of the beautiful view of the tree (though he understands that that is neither here nor there)
• He agrees with the prior two speakers
• He emphasized that 34, 35 or 36 parking spaces is not adequate for a 100+ room facility and the belief that there are rental spaces to be had nearby is not true
• The project is going to create an undue, additional number of parkers on the street, which the City, in its interest for taxes and parking ticket fees, will probably greet because there are plenty of police ticketing cars already
• The area is quite jammed with parkers
• Knocking off one to three spaces to save a tree is irrelevant in the scheme of things if they are going to rent spaces anyway
• The few people who come there will primarily be workers who are going to drive F-10’s and pickup trucks or larger, you need the extra setback
• He has a problem with an extended stay facility having a bar, where people will meet late into the evening
• Right next door is a wine shop, so they don’t need to have a bar because the rooms have kitchenettes
• Food should be served with the liquor, an old Evanston
• In the north/south alley, trucks park and idle for hours and when he asks them to shut them off they say they may not be able to start the truck if they do
• Garbage trucks that pick up garbage before 7:00 a.m., go into reverse and beep, which is disturbing at 6:00 a.m.
• He suggested that the City have restrictions on the use of those alleys and when they can deliver, pick up and remove

Chair Rainey said the City does have restrictions and an ordinance against idling. He said when he calls the police they do not get there quickly enough.

Chair Rainey opened the discussion to the Committee.

Ald. Fiske moved to introduce Ordinance 47-O-14 requiring the preservation of the elm tree.

Ald. Fiske thanked Mr. Blunk and his team for their cooperation and improvement of the project. She made the following points:
• The use of porous paving in the parking lot would result in the need for a smaller water detention tank, which would be a public benefit towards the goal of sustainability
• The City must consider the idea of taking down a 150-year-old elm tree that is healthy
• Neighbors who live on Grove and Hinman look out on the tree and enjoy the birds that nest and sing and the squirrels
• She encouraged the developers to do everything they can to preserve it
• She agrees with Mr. Mark’s suggestion to move the parking into another building
• The street where they are proposing the removal of 2 on-street parking spaces is heavily parked as she is there all the time
• The City is willing to remove them so the project can be successful
• She asked the developer to consider amending the parking around the tree to retain it
• She does not feel comfortable sharing a new tree with a neighboring property owner as those types of arrangements never work out well
• She is not sure of the success of the location of the proposed tree or how long it will remain there
• The proposed new tree certainly won’t provide the kind of benefits that the public has grown used to, provided by the existing tree
• She agrees with Ms. Beatty that the residents of the hotel would love to look out their windows and see the huge tree
• She believes it is something the developers can do

Regarding the parking area:
• The alley congestion, similar to the Main and Chicago project, is common where alleys join commercial and residential areas
• The setbacks are very important, especially in the east/west alley, which they should try to maintain
• Many neighbors have lived there for a long time with a fairly small office building and now they are looking at a large building going up
• 2 proposed projects have failed to move forward on this site; she commended the developer for proposing a building with a thoughtful positioning that will preserve as much view as possible
• A good trade-off for the two parking spaces on Chicago Avenue is a couple fewer spaces in the parking lot, keep the tree, consider the setbacks and then she is sure there will be a 5-0 vote

Chair Rainey said Paul D’Agostino stated that there is a dire prognosis for the tree regardless of what happens based on the construction process in general. She will have the letter posted on the website for the public. She read the last paragraph: “I question the survivability with the whole construction process in general. The need to trim a majority of the crown off, the compaction of the route zone and the potential damage to the trunk and major limbs during actual construction will likely make any efforts to preserve the tree ineffective with a project of this size on this parcel.” She said the letter contains several bullet points describing what the tree would go through.

Ald. Fiske argued that Mr. D’Agostino also referred to the tree as a healthy tree. She added that at the Kendall site, there are 3 ancient oak trees that the developer took great pains to protect with the understanding that every attempt would be made to preserve them. They understand that there is no guarantee with living things and if it does not survive, the developer gets his parking spaces back. She said using porous material will increase the ability to keep construction within a reasonable area. She noted that, as Ms. Beatty said, the roots are not at the surface and it will be able to withstand a little heavier impact than a newer tree.

Ald. Wilson seconded the motion to introduce Ordinance 47-O-14 to City Council.
The Committee voted 3-2 to introduce Ordinance 47-O-14 to City Council.

Ald. Wilson moved to introduce Ordinance 53-O-14 to City Council, seconded by Chair Rainey.

The Committee voted unanimously 5-0 to introduce Ordinance 53-O-14 to City Council.

IV. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION
   There were no items for discussion.

V. COMMUNICATIONS
   (PD1) Evanston Housing Corporation (EHC) Update
   For Communication and Information

   (PD2) Land Use Review Procedures
   For Communication

   Mr. Muenzer noted, given the time of the evening, that the information on PD1 was in the packet and he will address PD2 at a future meeting.

   Regarding the EHC update, Chair Rainey requested the status of the loans and what the implications would be for the borrowers, should they be sold or transferred to another entity. Mr. Muenzer said the board will provide direction as to how to proceed after the May meeting, but it is better for the home owners to have someone else service the portfolio. They will have the status of the loans once they have the appraisals, which were voted upon affirmatively by the board.

VI. ADJOURNMENT

   Ald. Fiske moved to adjourn, seconded by Ald. Wilson.

   The Committee voted unanimously 5-0 to adjourn.

   The meeting was adjourned at 8:35 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Bobbie Newman