EVANSTON WIND COMMITTEE
MINORITY REPORT

Hon. Elizabeth Tisdahl, Mayor of the City of Evanston, and Council Members:

This evening, June 20, 2011, you will be presented with the results of the review committee evaluating Mercury Wind and Off-Grid’s responses to Evanston’s RFI for a possible off-shore wind project in Lake Michigan.

We, the undersigned, as a minority of said committee, are not in agreement with the report submitted by our colleagues for the following reasons:

With regard to the only two responses received, Mercury Wind offers a conventional, propeller-driven application, but Off-Grid is offering magnetic levitation with no working application. Neither company has done any sort of work before. Neither has ever developed a project of any kind, much less a major project or a wind project either on land or water.

Since it would be foolhardy to proceed further with either of these entities on a potential half billion dollar project, one of the undersigned contacted FPL/NextEra (the largest wind developer in the USA), Iberdrola (the largest wind developer in the world), and Mainstream Power (the world’s largest developer of off-shore wind).

These three qualified non-respondents all said the cost of the contemplated project are prohibitive with no prospect of recovering the investment made. Further, conventional on-shore wind projects can provide power at one-fifth the cost of off-shore developments.

There is no compelling reason to work off-shore in the Midwestern United States where viable on-shore wind opportunities are plentiful.

What you receive from our colleagues this evening does not include this information, but details can be found in the Wind Farm Committee’s April 27, 2011 meeting notes, as revised to include these details.

Further, even though this possible project may take place off our shores, and is in keeping with our ideals for a "Climate Action Plan," Evanston currently has no jurisdiction or control over any such development as this. The Lake bottom is owned by the State of Illinois; unless new legislation is passed, any leasing arrangements will exclude us. Any development producing electricity would sign power purchase, interconnection and transmission agreements only with power companies, again not with us.

As far as staging for such a mammoth project, Evanston can offer nothing. We have "marinas" on our lakefront, but no deep water port to accommodate craft that are necessary to assist with such an endeavor. Our streets and roads, bridge clearances, load capabilities, turning areas, etc., cannot handle the support towers, propeller blades, generators, transmissions, shafting, hubs, nacelles ( housings), cranes, and all other appurtenances that would be conveyed to a dock for barging out on the Lake.
With the above in mind, may we, the undersigned, suggest that the Council close this attempt for now. Considering Evanston's fiscal responsibility to its citizens, and the limited resources of staff and even volunteer support, the City should proceed with environmental projects which are under it's control and have a reasonable probability of success.

Respectfully,

Fred J. Wittenberg  
IL Licensed Professional Engineer (inactive)  
BSMAE, Illinois Institute of Technology  
OSHA Competent Person  
RSES (Refrig. Serv. Engr. Society) Certified  
Citizen Police Academy Graduate, Class No. 24  
9th Ward Outreach Committee Member

Joseph J Jaskulski  
IL Licensed Professional Engineer  
Chief Operating Engineer (NIULPE)  
LEED Accredited Professional  
BSME, Valparaiso University  
MSME, Illinois Institute of Technology  
MBA, Northwestern University - Kellogg