MEETING MINUTES
EVANSTON PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Tuesday, January 31, 2017
Lorraine H. Morton Civic Center, 2100 Ridge Avenue, Room 2404
7:00 P.M.

Members Present: Robert Bady, Elliott Dudnik, Julie Hacker, Ken Itle, Mark Simon, Karl Vogel, and Diane Williams

Members Absent: Sally Riessen Hunt, and Tim Schmitt

Staff Present: Scott Mangum, Planning and Zoning Administrator, Division Manager
Mario Treto, Assistant City Attorney
Carlos Ruiz, Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator

Presiding Member: Diane Williams, Chair

CALL TO ORDER / DECLARATION OF QUORUM

The meeting was called to order at 7:07 pm with a quorum of 7 Commissioners present.

ELECTION OF 2017 PRESERVATION COMMISSION OFFICERS AND ASSOCIATE MEMBERS

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to elect Diane Williams as Chair, Ken Itle as Vice Chair, Karl Vogel as Secretary, and Anne O. Earle, Mary McWilliams, Anne McGuire, Kris Hartzell and Jack Weiss as Associate members, seconded by Commissioner Itle. The motion passed unanimously.

OLD BUSINESS

A. 115 Dempster St. (L/LSHD) - Replace roof dormers on front and rear roofs, add to existing garage footprint, add new room above existing garage, add new 2nd story passageway, Major Variance required.

Paul Janicki presented the project and said that at the December 2016 meeting, the Commission had two concerns: the size of the front dormers, and the size of the study addition on top of the expanded garage. The rear setback for the second story study is now 3’, bringing its scale down. A recently found Mayo drawing for the east porch, that was never built, is almost identical to what now is being proposed to the west. The
existing east porch is two stories. The reason for the two window dormers on the front elevation is to have adequate light and ventilation for bedrooms. The one critical dormer is the one in the middle. Other Mayo houses have double window dormers. There also proposed light wells on the south front elevation.

Paul Janicki showed schemes where a house could be built at 100 Greenwood (the neighboring property to the north), indicating that it is unlikely that a new house would be built next to the proposed garage and study. The property to the west (133 Dempster) would be mostly affected with the proposed second story study.

David Abraham owner of 100 Greenwood showed plans that the Commission had approved in 2009 for 100 Greenwood for the previous owner. The plan shows a structure close to the area where the study is being proposed. Conceptually, he could build a house closer to 115 Dempster than what P. Janicki had conceptualized.

Diarmaid Collins and Sarah McCarthy, owners of 133 Dempster, objected to the proposed addition because the protection of their privacy and the protection of the integrity and the historical significance of the two houses.

Commissioner Hacker asked for a drawing showing the dimensions of the existing and proposed dormers. Commissioner Simon thought the Zoning and Preservation issues are separate issues. Commissioner Hacker said she would have an easier decision to make recommending the Zoning variation for the expansion of the garage only. She said in this particular case, it would be easier that the case went to the Zoning Board of Appeals first.

Commissioner Itle said the proposed study still feels tucked on and it is too large in scale. It is a large mass off at the corner, and not integrated to the house. D. Collins and D. Abraham said their main objection is the proposed second story study.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a COA for 115 Dempster for dormer (option 1), enlarging the garage, the studio on top of the garage, passage way, breakfast bay, replacing miscellaneous windows, and light wells, for alteration standards 1-7, 9 and 10, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion failed. Vote: 6 nays, 1 abstention (Commissioner Dudnik).

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a COA for 115 Dempster for construction as previously discussed, standards 1-16 apply, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion failed. Vote: 6 nays, 1 abstention (Commissioner Dudnik).

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a COA for 115 Dempster for demolition, standards 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion failed. Vote: 6 nays, 1 abstention (Commissioner Dudnik).

Commissioner Itle made a motion for 115 Dempster that the Commission recommends that the Zoning Board of Appeals deny the request for major Zoning variance for the
project as presented at this meeting, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 1 abstention (Commissioner Dudnik).

PUBLIC HEARING

A. 1726 Hinman Avenue – Jim Kollross, applicant; Sigma Chi Foundation, owner. Nomination application to grant landmark status to building and lot of record at 1726 Hinman Avenue.

Chair Williams called the public hearing to order at 8:03 pm with a quorum present. Jim Kollross, applicant, asked to continue the public hearing to February 21, 2017 stating that new information on the property has been discovered that should be part of the nomination. After learning that the deadline for the new material was January 31, 2017, J. Kollross agreed to continue the public hearing to March 21, 2017.

Hal Morris, attorney, representing Sigma Chi Foundation (the owner of 1726 Hinman), also requested continuing the hearing to March 21, 2017, citing that he will be in a court case out of the state on February 21, 2017.

Commissioner Itle made a motion granting the applicant for the nomination of 1726 Hinman Avenue to file an amended application, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays. Commissioner Itle made a motion to continue the public hearing for the landmark nomination for 1726 Hinman to March 21, 2017, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed unanimously.

NEW BUSINESS

A. 2601 Sheridan Road (L) – Install new standing seam copper roofs on both fog houses. Tuck pointing and recoating of existing masonry, window and door restoration, wood trim and gutter replacement.

Lara Biggs, City Engineer, presented the application along with Stephany Levine, Senior Project Manager, Anil Khatkhate, Project Manager, and Justin Reed, contractor. L. Biggs said the two existing fog houses behind the Lighthouse need rehabilitation work. The north fog house has a standing seam copper roof; the south fog house has a slate roof. It was not possible to determine what the original roofing material was on both fog houses. The project is to replace both roofs with standing seam copper roofs to match. Also replace the copper gutters on the north building with new copper gutters, restore existing wood doors and windows, tuck point the building as needed and apply a new coating that allows the brick to breath. Anil Khatkhate said Carol Dyson, of the Illinois Historic Preservation Agency, recommended the copper roofs.

Commissioner Vogel made a motion recommending approval of the project at 2601 Sheridan Road for installing new standing seam copper roofs on both fog houses, tuck pointing and recoating existing masonry, windows and doors restoration, and copper
gutters replacement, based on standards for alteration 1-7, 9 and 10, seconded by Commissioner Bady The motion passed unanimously.

**B. 2350 Orrington Av. (NEHD)**—Construction of single family dwelling with attached 2-car garage.

Chris Coleman of North Shore Builders, presented the application for the construction of a single family home with an attached garage at 2350 Orrington (northwest corner of Orrington and Colfax, Lot 12 at Kendall Place). It is one of five lots that front on Orrington. The front elevation is on Orrington, the south side elevation is on Colfax. The rear west elevation is on the alley and the north side elevation is next to Lot 11.

Commissioner Dudnik said the south side elevation does not acknowledge the corner in any way. Commissioner Itle said it would be nice to articulate the south elevation with the front elevations of the houses along Colfax. Commissioner Hacker said it would helpful to have the front elevations of the houses on Colfax to provide context. Also look at the design of the fireplace and chimney.

The Commission asked the applicant to redesign the south elevation facing Colfax Street as being a significant façade at the corner of Orrington and Colfax. Also provide a view (photo/drawing) of the block showing the proposed house in context with the existing houses.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to continue the case of 2350 Orrington to the February 21, 2017 meeting, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed unanimously.

**C. 470 Sheridan Rd. Unit 2 (L)**—Replace ten 2nd-story double hung wood windows (6/1 divided lights) - four at rear court facing west and garage; and six at rear south facing cemetery, with double hung vinyl clad wood windows (6/1 divided lights) grids between panes of glass.

Joe DiNatale, contractor presented the application for the replacement of 10 double hung wood windows at 470 Sheridan Road, Unit 2, with 10 double-hung vinyl clad Simonton windows. Six windows face south towards the cemetery and four windows face west (garage, common area). The six divided lights are between the glass on the top sash. Each window is set to the opening. The storm windows will remain until their replacement. There is a gap of 4” between the window and the storm window. The new window jam is 3.5”. If necessary the window frame will be wrapped with aluminum, most likely caulked. The brick mold will be removed and a new one will be installed.

Margot Getman, owner, said the replacement windows will match the replacement windows the Commission had approved for another unit in 2012 (Michael Wonderlich of 490 Sheridan). Commissioner Dudnik said the Condo Association owns the storm windows and there are about 25 windows without storm windows. Panning the exterior
frame of the windows with aluminum will create a problem. Commissioner Itle asked if the storm windows are to remain, how the replacement window will be installed.

Commissioner Hacker made a motion to continue the application at 470 Sheridan Road, Unit 2, to February 21, 2017, when the Commission will look at the actual window to be used, obtain information of the windows used in 2012, the detailing for the storm and the window that will be used, and the installation detail, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 1 abstention (Commissioner Dudnik).

D. 220 Kedzie St. (LSHD) – New attached garage under house with driveway on the front yard. Integrated new, enlarged and roofed front porch.

Adrian Urbanowitz, architect, and Colin De Castro, owner, presented the application for a garage below grade into the basement (to be accessed from the street) and floor the replacement of the non-original front porch. There is no room on the side for a driveway into the back of the house. In the back of the property, there is an easement that allows them to walk out to the alley, one house east of the subject house. The property to the west has a curb cut and other houses across the street also have curb cuts.

Adrian Urbanowitz said the new garage door would be under the trim, above the garage door is the base of the building. The deck above the proposed garage door will be removed. The garage door is recessed from the front of the house.

Carlos Ruiz read a letter from Michel Kamin of 746 Michigan in opposition of the project. C. Ruiz said Public Works needs to approve the curb cut, and when backing up the car, the driver should be able to see the sidewalk before the rear of the car reaches the sidewalk. C. DeCastro said that there are other curb cuts on the same street block. C. Ruiz said Alderman Wynne had been in contact with another neighbor also opposing the project.

Commissioner Simon expressed concern with the design of the new porch. Commissioner Itle said the porch roof is cut off in line with the new driveway and collides with the front door. Also, wanted to know what materials are being used. Commissioner Hacker suggested having a hip on one side of the porch roof, so it would not look as if one side is cut off.

Commissioner Vogel made a motion to continue the project at 220 Kedzie until February 21, 2017. The applicant was asked to submit a 3D drawing and a better view of the proposed modifications to the east side driveway, garage and porch, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion passed unanimously

Dan Tornheim, architect, presented the project at 634 Judson to add a new wrap-around porch, and on south side, west, side and north side some new windows and some replacement windows. On the south side of the building there is a proposed insert Marvin window (the current window is rotted).

The Commission asked the applicant to reduce the scale of the proposed wrap-around porch and simplify the porch columns and remove the pediments. Also provide a 3D drawing of the revised wrap-around porch with the house. On the west elevation double French sliding doors and a new deck are proposed. On the north side three new awning basement windows are proposed.

Chair Williams expressed concern with the scale of the wrap around the porch; it goes too far around the house. It seems out of scale and size with a Victorian vernacular house. Commissioner Simon was concerned with the new entrance on the south elevation. Commissioner Vogel thought the columns are too large. Chair Williams was also concerned with what appears to be the removal of the bay. D. Tornheim said the bay remains; the roof of the bay is encapsulated by the roof of the porch and becomes the entry. Commissioner Dudnik said that side entrance is almost like the main entrance. Commissioner Itle said regarding the wrap around porch, the issues are the details and the over scale of the porch columns.

Dan Tornheim said he will lighten the porch columns, remove the brick piers, and remove both pediments from the south entry.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to table 640 Judson until the February 21, 2017 meeting, with a redesigned wrap around porch, and with side by side existing and proposed elevations, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed unanimously.

F. 605 Judson Av. (LSHD) – Alterations to the front façade: relocate front entry, new concrete stairs and stoop, remove concrete terrace, and replace with new concrete terrace. Remove fluted columns, patio doors, window boxes, replace asphalt shingle roof. Install new patio doors, new wood pergola, and replacement of selected windows. New patio doors and stairs at south elevation; relocation of rear door and stairs. Demolition of 2-car garage and shed, replace with 3-car garage. New cedar fence at side and rear yards.

Matthew Kerouac, architect presented the application at 605 Judson, a house classified as Renaissance revival with Craftsman details, without having a coherent architectural aesthetic. The proposed design embraces the Craftsman side of the house, the removal of the Doric columns, the fan windows, and the 6/6 double hung windows. The new front elevation has a pergola on the existing deck; the entry is moved from the south end to the north end. The eave brackets, the stucco finish and expose rafters will be retained. Also, installing a new shingle roof on the house.
Commissioner Hacker said that what is interesting and unique about the house would be changed and taken all away. Chair Williams said the blend of the Renaissance revival and Craftsman style, gives the house a unique historic character. M. Kerouac said what he is trying to create something that stands the test of time in terms of a coherent aesthetic.

The Commissioned Hacker read the standards for review of alteration and concluded that the project is taking away the stylist features (columns, arched windows, etc.). Commissioner Itle said the distinction is for the new elements that are being added, one wants to see that the project picks up on the original architecture and is sympathetic and compatible with the style with the new elements. That does not mean that original elements that that don’t check the box of the style should be scraped away. Matthew Kerouac said his intent was to embrace a style.

Commissioner Itle suggested preserving what is original and what exists, achieve whatever functional needs the owners have for the house, be additive and don’t scrape away things that might have not been chosen, but they are there.

Regarding the design of the new garage, Commissioners suggested the garage should be compatible with the house.

Commissioner Bady made a motion to continue the project at 605 Judson to February 21, 2017, seconded by Commissioner Hacker. The motion passed unanimously.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES of December 20, 2016.

Commissioner Bady made a motion to approve the December 20, 2016 meeting minutes with minor corrections as provided, seconded by Commissioner Hacker. The motion passed unanimously.

COMMITTEE REPORTS (Working Groups)

A. Preservation Ordinance Review Subcommittee - Update.

The Commission re-scheduled the Preservation Ordinance Review Subcommittee meeting from February 2, 2017 to February 10, 2017 due to scheduling conflicts.

VOLUNTEER REPORTS

A. Design Guidelines Volunteers – Update

Commissioner Hacker said the volunteers completed the design guidelines. Chair Williams said a meeting with City staff and the volunteers has been scheduled for March 2, 2017 to discuss the URL links in the City’s website related to Historic Preservation and the design guidelines.
STAFF REPORTS

Chair Williams announced that the Chicago Suburban Preservation Alliance next meeting is March 11, 2017 in Downers Grove.

Also City Council passed Ordinance 2-O-17 designating 2771 Crawford Avenue as landmark

Highland Park denied landmark designation of a Van Bergen design house.

Staff reported that the call for nominations for the 2017 Preservation & Design Awards will start in February. Nominations are due April 14, 2017.

DISCUSSION (No vote will be taken)

No discussion

ADJOURNMENT

A motion to adjourn the meeting at 10:28 pm passed unanimously.

Next Meeting: TUESDAY, February 21, 2017 at 7:00 P.M. (Subject to change)

Respectfully Submitted:

Carlos D. Ruiz
Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator