MEETING MINUTES
EVANSTON PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Tuesday, February 21, 2017
Lorraine H. Morton Civic Center, 2100 Ridge Avenue, Room 2404
7:00 P.M.

Members Present: Robert Bady, Elliott Dudnik, Julie Hacker, Ken Itle, Mark Simon, Tim Schmitt, and Diane Williams

Members Absent: Sally Riessen Hunt, and Karl Vogel

Staff Present: Scott Mangum, Planning and Zoning Administrator, Division Manager Carlos Ruiz, Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator

Presiding Member: Diane Williams, Chair

CALL TO ORDER / DECLARATION OF QUORUM

The meeting was called to order at 7:05 pm with a quorum of 6 Commissioners present. Short after, Commissioner Bady arrived.

OLD BUSINESS


At the request of the applicants, Commissioner Itle made a motion to continue the 917 Edgemere Court item to April 18, 2017, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 6 ayes, 0 nays.


At the request of the applicants, Commissioner Itle made a motion to continue the 2350 Orrington item to March 21, 2017, seconded by Commissioner Hacker. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 6 ayes, 0 nays.
C. **470 Sheridan Rd. Unit 2E (L)** - Joe DiNatale, applicant. Replace ten 2nd-story double hung wood windows (6/1 divided lights) - four at rear court facing west and garage; and six at rear south facing cemetery, with double hung vinyl clad wood windows (6/1 divided lights) grids between panes of glass. Applicable standards: [Alteration] 1-7, 9 and 10.

Joe DiNatale, contractor, presented the project at 470 Sheridan Rd., 2E. The replacement windows will be installed from the inside to the existing stop, without an aluminum wrap. The widow grid is in between the glass and the window is vinyl clad. The existing storm windows will remain. Chair Williams noted that the replacement of storm windows is a separate issue; the charge of the Commission is to determine if the proposed windows meet the standards for review.

Carlos Ruiz noted that the Commission approved replacement vinyl clad wood windows for a unit at 490 Sheridan Rd in 2012. Commissioner Itle said he would prefer the simulated divided lights as oppose to the grid. However, he would not oppose the grid between the panes of glass for consistency.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to approve a COA for 470 Sheridan, 2[E] for replacing six double hung wood windows (6/1) facing south and four double hung windows (6/1) facing west, with new Simonton double hung vinyl clad wood windows, with a grid between the glass, in accordance to the applicable standards of alteration 1-7, 9 and 10, seconded by Commissioner Itle. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays (Commissioner Bady had arrived to the meeting earlier).


Colin De Castro, owner, and Adrian Urbanowitz architect, presented the project. A. Urbanowitz said the revised elevation and cross section drawings show a gable roof over the front porch; the garage door flashed with the exterior wall on the front elevation and alternate garage door recessed from the exterior wall.

Carlos Ruiz read a report from the City Engineer regarding approval of the proposed driveway stating that, the plans have to show that a driver of the car backing out can see the sidewalk before the rear of the car is over the sidewalk. A driver would have an unobstructed line of sight, clear of retaining walls, porch and stairs; before encroaching into the right of way. The approval of the driveway is pending. Also, C. Ruiz said that Michael Kamin of 746 Michigan opposes the proposed front yard driveway and the changes to the house style. And Alderman Melissa Wynne (3rd Ward) was in communication with another neighbor also opposed to the project.
Colin DeCastro said that he identified at least three properties in the area with garages in the basement. A section of the existing front yard wood fence is being replaced with a new fence of the same style and material and a new gate at the driveway to match the fence.

Commissioner Hacker made a motion to approve at 220 Kedzie St. a COA for the proposed work as presented with the garage door on the front plane, the new integrated front porch, and the replacement of 8’ of the front fence and sliding gate of the same material (wood), as the applicable standards of alteration 1-7, 9 and 10 apply, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Hacker made a motion to approve at 220 Kedzie St. a COA for the enlarged front porch, construction of a section with a new fence to match the existing, a new gate and the construction of the new garage with two sets of doors, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Hacker made a motion to approve at 220 Kedzie St. a COA for the demolition of the front porch, section of the front yard fence and a section of the basement for the new garage, in accordance to the standards for demolition 1-5, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion passed. Vote: 7 aye s, 0 nays.

**E. 634 Judson Av. (L/LSHD)** – Dan Tornheim, Applicant. Add a new wrap-around porch on the east and south sides of the exiting house. 2. New windows in their family room on the north and south walls and a sliding French door with side-lights on the west facing wall. As well, a new replacement window is proposed in the kitchen on the south facing wall. 3. A new sliding French door is proposed to replace an existing exterior door on the south side of the house. 4. A new pair of swinging French doors is planned from the existing dining room to the new wrap-around porch. Applicable standards: [Alteration] 1-7, 9 and 10; [Construction] 1-15; [Demolition] 1-5.

Dan Tornheim presented the project. The Commission had issue with the heaviness of the wrap-around porch and the style; and the porch on the south side looking like a main entrance. The revised plans show a lighter farm style wrap-around porch (pediments above the door entrances were removed). The south side was scaled back at the projection of the bay (pushed back 2.5’) keeping it from looking as a main entrance, and the pediment was also taken off. The dimensions of the wrap-around porch are the same and still incorporate the south bay.

Chair Williams said she still would prefer the wrap-around porch to stop at the south bay. Commissioner Dudnik moved to approve a COA for 634 Judson Av. for a new wrap-around porch on the east and south sides of the existing house, for new windows in the family room on the north and south walls, and a sliding French door with side lights on the west facing wall, new replacement window in the kitchen on the south facing wall, new sliding French door replacing existing door on the south side of the house, a new pair of swinging French doors from the existing dining room to the porch,
with the applicable standards for alteration 1-7, 9 and 10, seconded by Commissioner Simon. He motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Dudnik moved to approve a COA for 634 Judson Av. for the construction of the new wrap-around porch on the east and south sides, the installation of new windows in the family room on the north and south walls, sliding French door with side lights on the west, new replacement window in the kitchen on the south, sliding French door to replace existing exterior door on the south side of the house, and new swinging French doors that open up to the wrap-around porch, with the applicable standards for construction 1-15, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Dudnik moved to approve a COA for 634 Judson Av. to provide all demolition necessary for all the construction approved before, with applicable standards for demolition 1-5, seconded by Commissioner Schmitt. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.


Mathew Kerouac presented the application. The revised plans maintain: most of the existing windows, except the windows needed to change for a function internally, the fluted columns, still switching the entrance from the south end to the north end bay. A berm was created across the terrace that will meet code by coming 3’ out and being at most 18” from the top of the terrace. The garage was simplified by removing the shed dormer. The garage windows will be in keeping with the existing windows.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to approve a COA for 605 Judson Ave. for alterations including: relocation of front entry, new concrete stairs and stoop, rebuilding the concrete terrace, replacing patio doors, window boxes, asphalt shingle roof, installing a new wood pergola, replacement of some selected windows, new patio stairs on the south elevation, relocation of the rear door and stairs, option B with a berm to address the safety issue at the front terrace (no railings), in that standards for alteration 1-7, 9 and 10 apply, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to approve a COA for 605 Judson Ave. for construction for all the work on the house and the construction of a new 3-car garage and a new fence at side and rear yards, in that standards for construction 1-15 apply,
seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to approve a COA for 605 Judson Ave. for demolition of the existing 2-car garage, shed, and miscellaneous work, in that standards for demolition 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion passed. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

NEW BUSINESS

A. 1422 Judson Av (L/LSHD) - Paul Janicki, applicant. Replace existing 1950’s garage with a new 2-car garage. Also, construct a new 1-story family room addition to the rear of the house. New stairs would lead from family room to grade. Applicable standards: [Construction] 1-14 and [Demolition] 1-5.

Paul Janicki presented the application. The existing garage was built in the 1950s is structurally unsound and will be demolished. The new 2-car garage is sited slightly further to the north to protect existing mature trees; it has exterior clapboard siding to match the existing siding on the house, carriage style garage doors and three casement windows facing the house. The family room addition has stairs to match the front stairs, newels, railings and columns. The clapboard exterior and roof pitch match that of the house front porch and pilasters that mimic the front porch columns. The details of the eave match the house. There are three casement windows with leaded glass on the south elevation and two French doors on the west elevation.

Commissioner Itle said he was ambivalent about the pilasters on the addition. Commissioner Bady moved to approve a COA for 1422 Judson to replace the existing garage with a new 2-car garage, and a new 1-story family room addition, in that standards for construction 1-14 apply, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Bady moved to issue a COA for 1422 Judson for demolition [of the existing garage] in that standards for demolition 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Itle. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.


Andrea Handley, owner, with Patrick Daily, Alon Shalen and Mark Szkutnik of Renewal by Andersen presented the application. M. Szkutnik said the replacement windows are an insert application into the window openings, the exterior wood trim will stay as is, the exterior stop will be cut away for the storm windows, the parting stop in between the two sashes will be removed, then slide the replacement window in place. The exterior is finished with a Fibrex exterior trim. On the front elevation, second story proposed windows have is a picture window above the double hung windows (11 and 12), a
double out-swing casement is replacing window (13) a French in-swing casement window on the north elevation attic. The remaining existing windows are double hung wood windows. The front elevation first floor window (1) will be replaced in kind.

Andrea Handley said windows 1, 11 and 12 on the front elevation of this double house are being considered for restoration. However, the restoration cost is an issue. M. Szkutnik said the insert window is placed in the weight pocket, from where the weight pocket is, from the exterior of the frame, where the visible glass starts is 3" along the sides. The largest difference in the center is the check rail, which is 2 - 30/32", where the proposed is 1- ¼". The total loss of glass is 1" all around per window.

Commissioner Hacker was concerned with the front elevation windows that if replaced will look different to the remaining windows of the double house. Commissioner Itle said windows 1, 2, 11, 12 and 13 should be restored.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to approve a COA for 516 Greenwood St. with the understanding that original windows 1, 2, 11, 12 and 13 will be restored, the remainder will be replaced with the Renewal by Andersen windows, in that standards for alteration 1-6, 9 and 10 apply, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

C. 640 Lincoln/Colfax Street (L/NEHD) – Amy Gauen, applicant. Construct a new sidewalk, accessible ramp and exterior stairs with metal handrails. Also install a 6' tall wood fence on the west side yard. Applicable standards: [Construction] 1, 5, 6, 7, 9, 10-13, and 16; [Demolition] 1-5.

Amy Gauen presented the application. The property is at the corner of Colfax St. and Orrington Ave. The work includes a new sidewalk, a 1:12 accessible ramp, and exterior stairs. The existing sidewalk will be modified into a low 1:20 sloping walk and leading to a ramp and new front porch stairs. The wood fence no longer is part of the project. Instead, landscaping would provide privacy. The paved area to the side would be a landscaped yard area. The porch peers and wall will be repaired. The existing stairs will be demolished and a new approach built.

Amy Gauen said the ramp exterior walls are stucco with a cast stone cap, and landscaped elements on the berm. The ramp’s wall railing is a round diameter handrail. The demolition includes the existing stairs and the concrete walk.

Commissioner Dudnik discussed the height of the ramp’s wall and handrail and its design. Rebecca Shields of Northwestern University said the intent with the landscaping and the height of the ramp’s wall is to make it not look like a ramp (12” inch high wall and 4” handrail). Commissioner Hacker suggested keeping the ramp’s wall simple (all stucco wall without the railing.) Amy Gauen said the railing could be designed after some element on the house, such the muntin pattern of the new windows.
Commissioner Hacker moved to issue a COA to 640 Lincoln/Colfax St. to construct a new sidewalk, accessible ramp, and exterior stairs (with a metal handrail to be redesigned for the ramp and administratively reviewed by staff), in that the applicable standards for construction 1, 5, 6, 7, 9, 10-13, and 16 apply, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 1 abstention (Commissioner Itle).

Commissioner Hacker moved to issue a COA to 640 Lincoln/Colfax St. for demolition for the porch work, as meeting standards for demolition 1-5, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 1 abstention (Commissioner Itle).

D. 2135 Orrington Avenue (L/NEHD) – Celeste Robbins, applicant. Remove front porch and rebuild in kind (except the wood floor will change to stone). Remove south side porch with concrete base and rebuilt with stone base. Remove rear (east side) porch and build a redesigned porch with masonry and wood. Applicable standards: [Construction] 1, 2, and 4-16; [Demolition] 1-5.

Celeste Robbins, architect, presented the application. The front porch, rear and side porch will be rebuilt. The existing front porch will be dismantled and the masonry will be coded to rebuild the porch on a new concrete foundation. The roof and columns will be replaced. All the stone work and railing will be reused. The wood deck will be replaced with stone to match the house’s existing rusticated grey stone base.

The existing back porch does not seem to be original to the house. The new back porch’s first story with wood columns extends to the door on the second story above. The base of the porch is stone. The south side porch with a concrete base and stairs will be removed. The new side porch has rusticated stone at the base and the railing will match that at the back porch.

Commissioner Hacker said about the back deck north elevation, the cantilever roof/deck seemed to extend too far from the columns below. Commissioner Dudnik moved to issue a COA for 2135 Orrington Ave. to rebuild the front porch (with a stone deck), rebuilding the south side porch with a new base; and building a newly re-designed porch on the east elevation, as standards for construction 1-2, and 4-16 apply, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Dudnik moved to approve a COA for 2135 Orrington Ave. for the removal of: the front porch, south porch, and the rear east side porch to enable the replacements, demolition standard 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

E. 630 Clinton Place (L) – Celeste Robbins - Remove 1970’s greenhouse and replace with a new family room. Remove existing 2-car garage addition and replace with a new 2-car garage. Remove and replace front porch. Restoration of original windows. Replacement of non-original windows. New window and door openings per plans
and elevations. New railing. New driveway configuration and curb-cut, patio &
garden wall, fence, decorative piers, sidewalks, mechanical equipment, and
landscaping. Major variation for family room addition to be built in required 30' rear
yard and chimney to be built beyond the 10% (3') permitted obstruction into required
yard. Applicable standards: [Alteration] 1-6, 9 and 10; [Construction] 1-16;
[Demolition] 1-5.

Celeste Robbins, architect, presented the application for 630 Clinton Place, an
Evanston landmark built in 1927, designed by architects Schmid and Ryan for the
Wieboldt family. It is also listed in the 1972 Illinois Historic Structures Survey. The
house was given to Northwestern University in 1963 and later sold in 1971 to John
Treder, who built the existing garage, the greenhouse and an entry to the house.

Celeste Robbins said the existing garage will be removed and replaced with a new and
wider 2-car garage that has a new roof orientation to match the front elevation. The
existing non original front entry will be removed and replaced with a new entry with a
canopy with brackets and slate roof. The new entry door is similar in style than the
existing original doors. The existing greenhouse at the rear was built in the 1970s and
replaced in the 1990s. It will be removed and replaced with a family room with large
casement Marvin windows, a brick base, and a slate roof. The proposed family room
requires a major zoning variance as follows: 6-8-2-8-A-4 The minimum yard
requirements for the R1 district are: Rear Yard 30 Feet; 6-8-2-8-A-1 Front yard parking
prohibited; 6-4-1-9-B-1 Yard obstructions attached to the principal structure shall
include: chimneys (among others listed). A yard obstruction may extend into no more
than 10" of the depth of a required yard (rear chimney extends more than 3' into
setback).

The non-original railing on top of the flat roof will be removed. All the original windows
will be restored; the non-original windows will be replaced with Marvin wood windows
with the simulated divided lights. Additional work includes: On the east elevation, first
floor - replace service door with new wood and glass door and add a new door of the
same style. Remove two mid-height windows above the service door and install
spandrel glass or louvers in the window openings (the Commission asked to infill the
openings with brick to match). On the south rear elevation, first floor - replace non-
original windows with casement windows and transoms above (in living room); remove
windows from kitchen, infill opening with brick and install French door, replace door
between living room and family room. On the west elevation, first floor - replace two
windows and doors in living room with three casement windows.

Tom Daly of 2614 Orrington Avenue said regarding the proposed variation for the family
room, that there will be a lot of objection from the neighborhood. He said thirty mature
trees were cut in August [2016]. He did not like the scale of the family room.

In response to Tom Daly’s comment, C. Robbins said the family room is 1 foot wider
and 6 inches deeper than the existing greenhouse. Carlos Ruiz said the neighbor to the
east wanted to know about the existing masonry wall and thought that the chimney for the family room was too large.

Ken Itle, regarding the west elevation, asked keeping the stone masonry openings more as they exist. Commissioner Simon made a motion to approve a COA for alterations necessary to replace the greenhouse with a new family room, replace the existing garage with a new 2-car garage; remove and replace front porch, restore original windows, replacement of non-original windows, construct new window and door openings per plans, remove railing on flat roof, alter the driveway configuration as shown, and curb-cut, patio, garden wall, fence, decorative piers, sidewalks, mechanical equipment, and landscaping, in accordance to standards for alteration 1-6, 9 and 10 for 630 Clinton Place, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to issue a COA for 630 Clinton Place for construction for a new family room, new 2-car garage, and replacement of the front porch, in accordance to applicable standards for construction 1-16, second by Commissioner Hacker. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Simon made a motion for 630 Clinton Place to approve demolition of the existing greenhouse, the existing 2-car garage, and the existing front porch, in accordance with demolition standards 1-5, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Simon moved regarding 630 Clinton Place that the Preservation Commission recommend approval of the variation of the yard requirements, to permit construction of the new family room and new chimney, in accordance with standard A and C [6-15-11-5 of the Zoning Ordinance], seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.


The January 31, 2017 minutes were deferred to the March 21, 2017 meeting.

5. COMMITTEE REPORTS (Working Groups)

   A. Preservation Ordinance Review Subcommittee - Update.

   Chair Williams said the Preservation Ordinance Review Subcommittee met on February 10, 2017. The next meeting is on March 2, 2017 at 8 am, room 2404, Lorraine H. Morton Civic Center.

6. VOLUNTEER REPORTS

   A. Design Guidelines Volunteers - Update
Commissioner Hacker said the Design Guidelines Volunteers will meet with Carlos Ruiz on February 24, 2017 to discuss their research regarding historic preservation information and a future link to Design Guidelines on the City’s website.

7. STAFF REPORTS

Carlos Ruiz informed to the Commission that he made a presentation on February 20, 2017 at the School of the Chicago Art Institute on Evanston’s historic preservation activities. Also, he announced that will make a presentation on February 23, 2017 to the City’s Planning & Zoning staff on the historic preservation review process.

Carlos Ruiz announced that next Suburban Preservation Alliance meeting will be held in Downers Grove on Saturday, March 11, 2017.

8. DISCUSSION (No vote will be taken)

No discussion.

ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Schmitt motioned to adjourn the meeting at 9:47 pm, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Respectfully Submitted:

Carlos D. Ruiz
Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator