MEETING MINUTES
EVANSTON PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Tuesday, May 16, 2017
Lorraine H. Morton Civic Center, 2100 Ridge Avenue, Room 2404
7:00 P.M.

Members Present: Elliott Dudnik, Ken Itle, Julie Hacker, Mark Simon, Tim Schmitt, Karl Vogel, and Diane Williams

Members Absent: Robert Bady

Staff Present: Scott Mangum, Planning and Zoning Administrator, Division Manager
Carlos Ruiz, Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator

Presiding Member: Dian Williams, Chair

CALL TO ORDER / DECLARATION OF QUORUM

Chair Williams called the meeting to order at 7:03 pm with a quorum present.

OLD BUSINESS


At the request of the applicants, Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to continue 917 Edgemere to the June 20, 2017 meeting, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

NEW BUSINESS

Commissioner Riessen Hunt arrived at this time.

A. 640 Emerson St. (L) – Dan Weese, applicant. From east elevation remove, steps, stone patio and concrete sidewalk. Construct new masonry accessible ramp at the main entrance of the building from grade to 1st floor at the east side of the building. Rework existing mechanical louver in attic at the north elevation for code required
upgrade to kitchen exhaust system. Applicable standards: [Alteration] 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 9, and 10; [Construction] 1, 2, 4, 6, 7, and 10-15; [Demolition] 1-5.

Dan Weese presented the application for 640 Emerson St. for building a ramp in the quad side to provide accessibility for the building and a louver for exhaust on the north elevation facing Emerson St. for a new kitchen. The porch in the quad will be extended and raised 6” to allow the ramp for accessibility. The ramp has a low wall of lannon stone and limestone trim to match another similar wall of another ramp in the quad. On the north elevation the existing louver will be enlarged. The trim pieces will be reused.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a COA for the proposed work at 640 Emerson St., in that standard for alteration 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 9, and 10 apply, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a COA for the proposed work at 640 Emerson St., in that standard for construction 1, 2, 4, 6, 7, and 10-15 apply, seconded by Commissioner Riessen Hunt. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a COA for the proposed work at 640 Emerson St.; in that standard for construction 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

B. 736 Michigan Av. (LSHD) – Adam Chiss, applicant. Replace existing hip-roofed detached garage with new 22'x 20’ garage. The structure will have a gable roof, 12” overhangs, asphalt shingle roof and wood double hung windows to match the existing residence. The new siding (Hardie 6” reveal) will match the color of the existing home. Applicable standards: [Construction] 1- 5, 7, 8, 10-13, and 16; [Demolition] 1-5.

Rachel Chis presented the project for 736 Michigan Av. The existing garage is beyond repair and to be demolished. The application is also for the construction of a new detached garage. The proposed construction materials are: hardi board siding, asphalt shingles on the roof. The 6/1windows will match the windows at the rear of the house.

Commissioner Dudnik recommended the installation of gutters and raising the hardi siding further from the grade. Commissioner Vogel made a motion to issue a COA for 736 Michigan Av. for the construction of 22’x20’ detached garage in that standards for construction 1- 5, 7, 8, 10-13, and 16 apply, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Vogel made a motion to issue a COA for 736 Michigan Av. for demolition of the garage. Standards for demolition 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Itle. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

John Potter presented the application with Anub Goel, owner. The house was built in 1892. The project is a 6’x18’addition under a second floor overhang; a new door with a canopy leading to the existing landing, and a new brick veneer chimney on the south elevation for a fireplace in the living room. The proposed materials meet the existing cedar siding and brick for the chimney. The proposed new windows match the height of the existing windows, i.e. kitchen windows.

Commissioner Riessen Hunt suggested matching the rhythm of the second floor windows on the first floor addition. Commissioner Itle said he was not as concerned with the proposed windows for the first story addition.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to approve a COA for alterations at 1241 Hinman Av. for construction of a new fire place and chimney, a new rear off first floor to be flush with existing 2nd floor over hang, new windows at addition, new entry door at rear, and new wood stairs at addition, in accordance to the applicable standards of alteration 1-10, seconded by Commissioner Vogel. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 2 abstentions.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to approve a COA for construction at 1241 Hinman Av., as previously described improvements, in accordance to applicable standards of construction 1, 3, 7, 10, and 12-15, seconded by Commissioner Itle. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 2 abstentions.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to approve the demolition of the existing deck, in accordance to demolition standards 1-5, seconded by Commissioner Vogel. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.


Paul Janicki presented the application for 1620 Judson Av. The project includes a new screen porch on the south side elevation and two new casement windows on the north side elevation replacing two boarded up windows. On the west rear elevation, new French doors with transoms, stairs, breakfast bay, screen porch and iron rail (first floor). Also, three 6/1 double hung windows on the second floor are being replaced. The breakfast bay is below these windows, and to the right of the bay is the screen in porch. On the south elevation, first floor work includes removing casement windows; installing a new door and two double hung windows. Also, to the right of the new double hung windows, remove two existing double hung windows and install a new door for the
mudroom. Also, a new staircase leading to the mudroom and down the basement, detailed the same as the front porch iron rail.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a COA for the renovation at 1620 Judson Av. including removal of the rear porch, brick patio and deck, construction of a new porch, breakfast bay, new exterior stairs and brick wall and changes to window openings. Standards for alteration 1-10 apply, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a COA for the project at 1620 Judson Av. for construction. Standards for construction 1-5, 7, 8, 10-15 apply, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a COA at 1620 Judson Av. for demolition as described. Standards 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.


Jason Pietrucha, owner, presented the application for 2517 Central Street, for a new cedar fence, replacing a chain link fence, a new deck at the rear for each unit, new French doors to the decks, new front soffit and fascia, replacing aluminum garage siding with cedar siding, new concrete retaining walls for the stairwells. The existing windows are aluminum-clad windows. The new Marvin windows are also aluminum clad.

Thomas Hughes of 2518 Hartzell St. was concerned with visibility and exposure from the rear decks to his property. J. Pietrucha said he plans a Bonsai Japanese garden in the rear and protecting a tree, minimizing the view from his neighbor.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to approve a COA for 2517 Central St. to construct new rear stairwell and two wood decks, one on each level. Install two sliding French doors on each level that walk out to the deck area. Demolition of existing fence and replace with 6’ cedar fence. Replace retaining wall, stairs and three concrete squares with new concrete, and replace garage aluminum siding with cedar siding. Applicable standards of alteration 1-10; seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays (replacement of front facade soffit and fascia not included).

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to approve a COA for 2517 Central St. for the construction of a new stair and two decks, installing two sliding doors, construction of a
6 ft. high cedar fence, replacing the retaining walls and stairs, and replacing the garage siding with cedar siding. Construction standards 1, 3, 7, 10, and 12-15 apply, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to approve a COA for 2517 Central St. for the demolition of: the existing stairwell, fence and removal of the garage siding. Demolition standards 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

F. 811 Clinton Pl. (L) – Wendy Vasquez, Applicant. Replace double-hung windows on East, West and North elevations of house with Marvin Ultimate Double-hung Insert wood windows (note: all window replacements are located on the second floor only). Revise planned garage materials to the following: fiberglass Marvin Integrity windows, steel service door, steel overhead door. Applicable standards: [Alteration] 1-10.

Wendy Vasquez, owner, presented the application for 811 Clinton Pl. Ms. Vasquez said the Commission approved a similar proposal in October 2016. The current proposal is for the second floor windows only. The front elevation remains the same. The revised windows are the Marvin Ultimate double hung insert wood windows. Six out of eight windows, one on the east, two on the north, and three on the west elevations, would be replaced with insert windows, where the existing wood frames remain. The two windows on the front would be full replacements.

The Commission discussed the proportion of the insert windows versus the full replacement windows. Commissioner Itle noted that there is a slight difference between them.

Regarding changes to the garage, Wendy Vasquez said her contractors are recommending a steel service door, steel overhead garage door, and Marvin fiber glass windows with same muntin pattern for the previously approved garage.

Commissioner Hacker made a motion to issue a COA for 811 Clinton Pl. to replace the double hung windows on the east, west and north elevations with Marvin Ultimate double hung insert wood windows, and the revised garage materials to fiber glass Marvin Integrity windows, steel overhead door, and recommendation for a wood service door instead of a steel door. Applicable standards for alteration 1-10 apply, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

G. 2014 Orrington Av. (NEHD) – Interior remodeling for up to date use of religious institution; interior and exterior remodeling for ADA accessibility; partial 3rd floor/attic addition to accommodate needed spaces; updated front and rear facades; new elevator for ADA accessibility. Requires Zoning Variations: 6-8-2-4 special use permit for a religious institution required due to increase in building/impact 6-8-2-9-A Maximum height permitted is 35’ to peak or 2.5 stories, whichever is less Proposed height 35’ to peak of roof (excluding front parapet and elevator overrun) However,
knee-wall exceeds 3' and therefore constitutes a full 3rd story 6-18-3 Exterior knee-walls shall not exceed three (3) feet in height. 6-8-2-8-B-3 15' interior side yard setbacks required for non-residential structure Propose 5.4' north interior side yard setback and 9.5' south interior side yard setback 6-4-1-9-A-3 Block average's front yard setback (to house facades, not porches) is 34' Proposed front yard setback 26.9' (extending higher than existing) Applicable standards: [Alteration] 1-10; [Construction] 1-16; [Demolition] 1-5.

At the request of the applicant, Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to reschedule the project at 2014 Orrington Avenue until the June 20, 2017 Preservation Commission meeting, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

The applicant will have a neighborhood meeting before the next meeting.

H. 2771 Crawford Av. (L) – National Register Nomination. Preservation Commission’s advisory review to the Illinois Historic Sites Advisory Council (IHSAC) - The City of Evanston as a Certified Local Government, through the Chief Elected Official and Preservation Commission has an opportunity to advise why the subject place does or does not satisfy the National Register criteria and explain the reasons for the advice. The written recommendation must be received by the IHPA before June 30, 2017.

Chris Enck, owner, presented his nomination of his landmark house at 2771 Crawford Avenue to the National Register of Historic Places, and asked for the Preservation Commissions’ letter supporting the nomination to the Illinois Historic Sites Advisory Council (IHSAC), by June 30, 2017.

The nomination states the architect John S. Van Bergen designed the John B. Irving House. Built in 1928 in the Prairie School style, the house was originally located at 1318 Isabella Street in Wilmette, Illinois. Threatened with demolition, the house was relocated in October 2014 to a temporary site in Evanston and moved to 2771 Crawford Avenue in March 2015.

The nomination cites the National Register criterion C (Property embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction; and under Criteria Considerations B (the property is removed from its original site).

Commissioner Hacker made a motion that a letter of support from the Commission be prepared by staff for listing in the National Register of Historic Places for 2771 Crawford Av. The letter will cite the National Register, Criterion C (Property embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction; and under Criteria
Considerations B (the property is removed from its original site), seconded by Commissioner Riessen Hunt. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

**APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES** of March 21 and April 18, 2017.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to approve the March 21, 2017 meeting minutes as corrected, seconded by Commissioner Riessen Hunt. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to approve the April 18, 2017 meeting minutes as amended, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 5 ayes, 3 abstentions (Williams, Hacker and Riessen Hunt).

**COMMITTEE REPORTS (Working Groups)**

A. Preservation Ordinance Review Subcommittee - Update.

Chair Williams said the Subcommittee did not meet in May. A clean copy of the text amendment will be distributed to the Subcommittee members.

The Commission scheduled the next Subcommittee meeting on June 1, 2017 at 8 am.

**VOLUNTEER REPORTS**

A. Design Guidelines Volunteers – Update

Commissioner Hacker said the volunteers (Hacker, Dudnik and Jack Weiss, Associate member) met with Carlos Ruiz and Hillary Beata with the City’s IT department and went through a strategy for the written guidelines to be posted in the City’s website.

**STAFF REPORTS**

Carlos Ruiz said the preservation awards presentation is scheduled on June 26, 2017 in the City Council chambers.

The nomination of 1726 Hinman Av. for landmark designation is scheduled for City Council on Monday, May 22, 2017. Scott Mangum said the owners’ attorney will be requesting continuance to the June 12, 2017 City Council meeting, due to scheduling conflicts.

Carlos Ruiz said the letters supporting the nomination will be included in the report to the City Manager.

Scott Mangum informed that the Chicago Metropolitan Agency for Planning (CMAP) is developing a new regional comprehensive plan called ‘On to 2050.’ The City of
Evanston will be hosting one of the forums on Tuesday, June 27, 2017, 5-6:30 pm in the Parasol room. The City’s Boards, Commissions and Committees are invited.

**DISCUSSION** (No vote will be taken)

No discussion.

**ADJOURNMENT**

Commissioner Riessen Hunt made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 8:59 pm, seconded by Commissioner Vogel. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Respectfully submitted,

Carlos D. Ruiz  
Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator