MEETING MINUTES
EVANSTON PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Tuesday, June 20, 2017
Lorraine H. Morton Civic Center, 2100 Ridge Avenue, Room 2404
7:00 P.M.

Members Present: Robert Bady, Elliott Dudnik, Ken Itle, Julie Hacker, Mark Simon, Tim Schmitt, Karl Vogel, and Diane Williams

Members Absent: Sally Riessen Hunt

Staff Present: Carlos Ruiz, Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator

Presiding Member: Diane Williams, Chair

CALL TO ORDER / DECLARATION OF QUORUM

Chair Williams called the meeting to order at 7:03 pm with a quorum present.

OLD BUSINESS


At the request of the applicants, Commissioner Simon made a motion to continue 917 Edgemere to July 18, 2017, seconded by Commissioner Vogel. The motion passed: Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

B. 2014 Orrington Av. (NEHD) – Dov Hillel Klein, applicant. Exterior remodeling for ADA accessibility; partial 3rd floor/attic addition; updated front and rear facades; new elevator for ADA accessibility. Requires Zoning Variations: 6-8-2-4 special use permit for a religious institution required due to increase in building/impact 6-8-2-9-A Maximum height permitted is 35’ to peak or 2.5 stories, whichever is less Proposed height 35’ to peak of roof (excluding front parapet and elevator overrun) However, knee-wall exceeds 3’ and therefore constitutes a full 3rd story 6-18-3 Exterior knee-walls shall not exceed three (3) feet in height. 6-8-2-8-B-3 15' interior side yard setbacks required for non-residential structure Propose 5.4’ north interior side yard setback and 9.5’ south interior side yard setback 6-4-1-9-A-3 Block average's front yard setback (to house facades, not porches) is 34’ Proposed front yard setback 26.9’ (extending higher than existing) Applicable standards: [Alteration] 1-10; [Construction] 1-16; [Demolition] 1-5; [Zoning Variation] A and C.

At the request of the Rabbi Klein, Commissioner Hacker made a motion to continue 2014 Orrington Av. to July 18, 2017, seconded by Commissioner Vogel. The motion passed: Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.
NEW BUSINESS

A. 324 Dempster St. (LSHD) – Abas Fard, applicant. Reconstruct rear stairs to the 1st and 2nd floor, install new rear patio, and reinstall the skirt on the front porch below the deck floor. Applicable standards: [Alteration] 1-10; [Construction] 1, 6, 7, 10, 12, and 13.

Abas Fard, owner and Frank Kashkouli, architect, were present. Chair Williams said that in conversations with City staff, this project qualified for administrative approval. Neighbors were notified about the project. No one in the audience spoke about the project.

Commissioner Hacker made a motion that 324 Dempster St. be approved administratively, seconded by Commissioner Itle. The motion passed: Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.


Mary Tobin, owner and Charlie Friedlander, architect, were present. Chair Williams said this project qualified for administrative approval. No one from the audience spoke about the project.

Commissioner Vogel made a motion that 1412 Oak Av. be approved administratively, seconded by Commissioner Itle. The motion passed: Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

C. 811 Clinton Pl. (L) – Wendy Vasquez, Applicant. Construct 2nd-story addition over existing foundation. Originally approved plan (10/20/16) called for the second story to cantilever slightly over the first floor. Revised proposal calls for first floor to be cantilevered from existing foundation in order to change the shape of the interior family room. Zoning Variation required 6-8-2-7 Maximum allowed building lot coverage in the R1 District is 30%. 33% existing building lot coverage (variation approved). 33.6% proposed building lot coverage. Applicable standards: [Construction] 1, 3, 7, 8, 10, and 12-15; [Demolition] 1-5; Zoning Variation] A and B.

Wendy Vasquez, owner, presented the application at described above. Commissioner Dudnik said the recess entry way on first floor of the east elevation is out of character with the rest of the proposed addition. Commissioner Hacker suggested moving that door on the east elevation to be flush with the exterior door. Ms. Vasquez said that moving that door as suggested would not work because the existing double doors on the north elevation would be too close. Commissioner Itle said he would rather see the addition adjusted to the original house, and not modify the house.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion approving the COA for the proposed revisions to 811 Clinton Pl. for the (2-story) cantilever and changes to doors with the suggestion to bring the recessed door flush with the east elevation, and for administrative review,
seconded by Commissioner Hacker. Commissioner Simon thought the door change was required. Commissioner Dudnik then withdrew his motion.

Commissioner Hacker then made a motion to issue a COA for the proposed revisions to 811 Clinton Pl. with administrative review to change the recessed door, and the cut out opening to the rear in the family room, seconded by Commissioner Itle. The Commission failed. Vote: 2 ayes, 5 nays, 1 abstention.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a revised COA for 811 Clinton Pl. for the various changes to the first floor cantilever and doors as shown on the drawings for construction, with the optional suggestion that they study the recessed entry for administrative review by staff, and construction standards 1, 3, 7, 8, 10, and 12-15 apply, seconded by Commissioner Schmitt. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 1 nay, and 1 abstention.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a COA for 811 Clinton Pl. for the demolition work; as standards of demolition 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 1 nay, and 1 abstention.

Commissioner Itle made a motion recommending to ZBA the zoning variation for the project at 811 Clinton Pl. for the 33.6% proposed building lot coverage; and standard A and B apply. The motion passed. Vote: 7 ayes, 1 abstention.

D. 2145 Sheridan Rd. Lot 1 (Located within 250 Ft. of Sheridan Rd. right-of-way)
Per Resolution 58-R-15 for Advisory Feedback Only – Teri Wright, applicant. Northwestern University Technological Institute A-B Wing Infill project The new addition will provide approximately 46,800 net square feet to the existing building (roughly 920,000 net square feet). The use of the new addition is similar in function to the existing building providing offices, research laboratories and instructional areas. Applicable standards: [Construction] 1, 3, 7, 8, 10, 12-15; [demolition] 1-5.

Teri White of Northwestern University (NU) and Project Manager introduced the application as described above. Michael Fox of Flad Architects and Bonnie Humphrey, Director of Design at NU were present. M. Fox said Holabird and Root designed the building in 1942; it has had a number of additions over time. Flad Architects was involved most recently in 2012 with the ‘J’ Wing. Prior infills date to 2010. The A-B addition mirrors the existing F-G Wing. The A-B addition has a vertical expression with the windows and a penthouse on top. The materials are consistent with the original building material (carved limestone). The new windows are aluminum with divided lights. There is a skylight element (facing south). The existing exterior walls to become interior walls will retain the existing windows.

The Commission thanked the applicant for the presentation.

E. 2331 Sheridan Rd. (L) – Dan Weese, applicant. North Elevation: new wood exit door and exterior metal exit stair; new sheet metal mechanical louvers; and new masonry infill to replace existing basement windows; remove existing non-original
brick infill and replace with new historic wood windows. West Elevation: new basement door with glass to replace existing of same size and material; new masonry infill to replace existing basement window, new sheet metal louver to replace existing in same location and of same size. South Elevation: new exit doors with glass at fire escape to replace existing of same size and material; new sheet metal mechanical louvers. East Elevation (please note that this elevation is not visible from the public way): new wood main entry door to replace existing. Applicable standards: [Alteration] 1-10; [Demolition] 1-5.

Dan Weese presented the application as described above. The building is on the center axis of the quad. The primary focus of the exterior changes is on the north façade, including: an exit stair on the first floor, infill with brick the basement windows, new exit door, removing infill brick from window opening and install three new wood windows, and an exhaust louver. The alterations to the south and east elevations are described above. Salvaged brick will be used on all exterior brick work.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to approve a COA for alterations for 2331 Sheridan Rd. on the north elevation: new wood exit door and exterior metal exit stair; new sheet metal mechanical louvers; and new masonry infill to replace existing basement windows; remove existing non-original brick infill and replace with new historic wood windows. West Elevation: new basement door with glass to replace existing; new masonry infill to replace existing basement window, new sheet metal louver to replace existing. South Elevation: new exit doors with glass at fire escape to replace existing of same size and material; new sheet metal mechanical louvers. East Elevation: new wood main entry door to replace existing; in accordance with the applicable standards for alteration 1-10, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes 0 nays.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to approve a COA for demolition for 2331 Sheridan Rd. to accomplish the necessary work for alteration, in accordance with standard for demolition 1-5, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

F. 325 Greenwood St. (LSHD) – Paul Janicki, applicant. Remove existing rear mudroom bay, and exterior stairs. Add a new bay and exterior stairs. Demo existing garage; add pavers to replace asphalt driveway and also pour concrete at front entry steps. Requires Zoning variations 6-8-2-8-A-4: 30’ rear yard setback required (12.9’ rear yard setback proposed at addition); 6-8-2-7: Maximum 30% building lot coverage permitted (46.6% building lot coverage proposed – 44.6% existing; 6-8-2-8-C-3: 5’ interior side yard setback required for open parking (.5’ east interior side yard setback proposed for open parking). Applicable standards: [Alteration] 1-10; [Demolition] 1-5; [Zoning Variation] A and C.

Paul Janicki presented the project. The house is a brick Queen Anne with wraparound porch and double hung windows. An existing bay with windows at the rear of the house will be demolished and replaced with a bay at the northwest corner. The existing non-original brick garage built in 1924 will also be demolished.

Preservation Commission Page 4 of 8
On the east side elevation of the house, the proposed bay has a French door next to a double hung window. On the north rear elevation the proposed bay has a brick base, with double hung windows, and new stairs and landing. On the west side elevation the proposed bay has two double hung windows. Also, new French door on the house, with stairs below grade to the basement.

Commissioner Dudnik asked about the lower pitched roof over the proposed bay. P. Janicki said considering all the other roof pitches on the main house; he tried simplifying the pitch of the roof on the bay. Commissioner Dudnik asked about the height of the proposed windows, which appear taller than the existing windows. P. Janicki said he wanted to have more light inside the bay.

Commissioner Simon asked about the major zoning variation, is it needed because parking is on the proposed driveway? P. Janicki said, yes.

Commissioner Hacker made a motion to issue a COA for 325 Greenwood St. for alteration, standards 1-10, to remove the existing rear mudroom bay and exterior stairs. Adding a new bay, exterior stairs, replace the asphalt driveway with pavers, and pour concrete at front entry steps, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Hacker made a motion to issue a COA for 325 Greenwood St. for demolition, to remove the existing mudroom bay, and existing garage. Applicable standards are 1-5, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Hacker made a motion to recommend the Zoning variations, standards A and C for 325 Greenwood St. as described above, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

G. 2126 Orrington Av. (NEHD) - John Issa, applicant. Revised elevations for previously approved project to replace the existing non-historic, 2-story addition on east facing front façade with an open, wrap-around porch; replace all windows; replace the rear deck and garage, and add a 3-season porch to the SW corner of the house. Applicable standards: [Alteration] 1-10; [Construction] 1-15; [Demolition] 1-5.

Josh Barney, owner, and John Issa, architect presented the application as described above. They made changes to the previously approved work due to budget constraints and functionality. The revisions include: on the front elevation, the bay windows from double hung to picture windows with divided lights, the front door without side lights, but adding a transom above, and the base under the porch from brick to wood. At the rear west elevation, first floor, two doors with divided lights with a transom above, and two double hung windows with a transom above.
On the south elevation, first floor, reduce the length of the wrap around porch, eliminate the chimney from the screen porch, adding a double hung window and replacing a double hung window with a taller double hung window and transom above. Second floor, remove an existing window and eliminate a proposed window. On the south elevation, first floor, eliminate screen from rear deck, large double hung bay windows to picture windows (first and second floor). Second floor, remove existing round window and casement window and replace with double hung windows.

Commissioner Hacker suggested looking at all the windows, and reassess the windows configuration, such as retaining double hung windows (even if simulated) instead of picture windows, and reconsider adding muntins, where there were no muntins. The proposed revisions for review conflict with the existing scale of the openings. Commissioner Hacker suggested carefully examining where to use muntins and where not to.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a revised COA for the project at 2126 Orrington Av. with the understanding that the windows will be reviewed with staff, with an eye towards coming up with a better solution for the front windows at the front bay, and other places where divided lights are shown on the existing drawings to regularize and simplify the design; in that standards for alteration 1-10 apply, seconded by Commissioner Vogel. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 2 nays.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a revised COA for the project at 2126 Orrington Av. for new construction as previously described, in that standards of construction 1-15 apply, seconded by Commissioner Vogel. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 2 nays.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a revised COA for the project at 2126 Orrington Av. for demolition work as required, in that standards of demolition 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Vogel. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 2 nays.


Mike Hauser, architect, presented the project as described above. The house at 802 Clinton Pl. is a landmark. The two-story garage follows the period and style of the main house (stucco finish with half timbering on the upper floor). The existing garage is too small and in state of disrepair. The new garage doors are wood and the casement windows have divided lights.

Commissioner Bady made a motion to approve the COA for the project at 802 Clinton Pl. for the construct two-car garage with living space above, that standards of construction 1-4, 7, 8, 10-13, and 16 apply, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.
Commissioner Bady made a motion to approve the COA for the project at 802 Clinton Pl. for demolition of the one-car garage; in that standards of demolition 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Vogel. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.


Adam Goodman, owner, presented the application as described above. Commissioner Hacker commended A. Goodman for the good design of the addition.

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to issue a COA for the project at 811 Colfax St. in that the applicable standards for alteration 1-10 have been met, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to issue a COA for the project at 811 Colfax St. in that the applicable standards for standards for construction 1, 3, 5, 7, 8, 10 and 12-15 have been met, seconded by Commissioner Vogel. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to issue a COA for 811 Colfax St. in that the standards for demolition [one-car garage] have been met, seconded by Commissioner Hacker. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES of May 16, 2017.

Carlos Ruiz said that the May 16, 2017 minutes will be submitted for approval on the July 18, 2017 meeting agenda.

COMMITTEE REPORTS (Working Groups)


Chair Williams said that Commissioner Simon submitted additional text amendments to the Preservation Ordinance draft. Also, the Rules and Procedures will be reviewed at the July 13, 2017 Subcommittee meeting.

VOLUNTEER REPORTS

Design Guidelines Volunteers – Update

Commissioner Hacker said the volunteers submitted for staff comments the historic preservation information to be placed on line.
STAFF REPORTS

A. 2771 Crawford Avenue – Letter of Support for Listing in the National Register (for approval)

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to accept the letter revised/corrected/amended and send it to Andrew Heckenkamp [of IHPA], supporting the listing of the Irving House [2771 Crawford Av.] in the National Register of Historic Places, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

B. 2017 Preservation & Design Awards – Update, August 24, 2017 Awards Presentation

Carlos Ruiz reported that on June 9, 2017, the Jury for the 2017 Preservation and Design Awards selected 5 nominations as award recipients out of eleven nominations. The awards presentation is scheduled on August 14, 2017.

C. CMAP Workshop – June 27, 2017

Carlos Ruiz reminded Commissioners of the CMAP Workshop on June 27, 2017.

Chair Williams announced that the annual meeting of Landmarks Illinois is on June 29, 2017.

DISCUSSION (No vote will be taken)

No discussion.

ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Bady made a motion to adjourn at 9:26 pm on June 20, 2017, seconded by Commissioner Schmitt. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Next Meeting: TUESDAY, July 18, 2017 at 7:00 P.M. (Subject to change)

Respectfully submitted,

Carlos D. Ruiz
Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator