MEETING MINUTES
EVANSTON PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Tuesday, December 19, 2017
Lorraine H. Morton Civic Center, 2100 Ridge Avenue, Room 2404
7:00 P.M.

Members Present: Robert Bady, Elliott Dudnik, Ken Itle, Suzi Reinhold, Tim Schmitt, Mark Simon, and Diane Williams

Members Absent: Julie Hacker, Jamie Morris, Sally Riessen Hunt, and Karl Vogel

Staff Present: Carlos Ruiz, Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator,

Presiding Member: Diane Williams, Chair

CALL TO ORDER / DECLARATION OF QUORUM

Chair Williams called the meeting to order at 7:03 pm with a quorum present.

OLD BUSINESS


Healy Rice presented the application as described above. The house is 28” higher than the ground. The ramp is 28’ long, including a landing where a window will be replaced by a door to match an existing door. The pavers leading to the ramp will remain.

Commissioner Elliott suggested building a 1:20 ramp and eliminating the railing. H. Rice said there is not enough distance between the garage and the house for that.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to issue a COA for 911 Edgemere for the construction of the ADA ramp on the north side of the house, with a new access door in accordance to the applicable standards for construction1, 5, 7, 10, and 12-15, seconded by Commissioner Schmitt. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7-0.

B. 708 Forest Av. (LSHD) – Sebastian Koziura, applicant. Re-build back porch and deck. Tear down existing 3-car garage (detached) and build new 3-car garage (detached) Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-10]; [Construction - Garage 1- 4, 7, 8, 10- 13 and 16] and [Demolition 1-5].

Due to the absence of the applicant, Commissioner Reinhold made a motion to continue the item to January 9, 2018, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.
C. 818 Colfax St. (NEHD) – Bill & Laura Pelletier, applicants. Demolish existing garage in the rear south of the property and construct a new garage with workshop above. The design reflects the existing house and character of the district by utilizing similar materials, colors and articulation. Applicable standards: [Construction - Garage 1- 4, 7, 8, 10- 13 and 16] and [Demolition 1-5].

Jon Hiatt said that as recommended by the Commission at the last month meeting, regarding the proposed garage’s faux timbering on the upper part, the horizontal timbers were removed and the width between them increased. The material was simplified from white stucco above the lower brick to yellow stucco, and the lower brick base remains (based on references from the neighborhood).

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to issue a COA for 818 Colfax St. as described, in that applicable standards for construction 1- 4, 7, 8, 10- 13 and 16 are met, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 1 abstention (Chair Williams).

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to issue a COA for 818 Colfax St. for the demolition of the existing garage in that standards for demolition 1-5 are met, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 1 abstention (Chair Williams).

NEW BUSINESS

A. 1047 Forest Av. (L/LSHD) – Susan Bedard, applicant. On southeast rear corner of the first floor of existing addition, remove and replace a pair of south facing windows (non-original). Install a direct vent fireplace and bookcases on the south wall. Two small square windows will flank the new fireplace. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-10] and [Demolition 1-5].

Steve Knutson presented the application. S. Knutson said the application was submitted the day before a fire, thus the boarded up windows. The proposed work in on the south façade of an existing rear addition. The existing drawings were done by others for a project that was permitted in 2013, but not reviewed by the Preservation Commission. The three first floor windows will be removed and replaced with a pair of smaller windows (for room for a gas fireplace and book shelves in the interior). The 14" x 14" vent will be painted the same color as the siding. The existing east and west windows and second story windows facing south remain.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to issue a COA for 1047 Forest Av. for alterations of the southeast rear corner of the first floor of existing addition, removing and replacing a pair of south facing windows (non-original). Install a direct vent fireplace and bookcases on the south wall, and two small square windows will flank the new fireplace; in accordance applicable standards for alteration 1-10, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.
Commissioner Simon made a motion to issue a COA for demolition for 1047 Forest Av. for removal of the existing south facing windows and other demolition necessary for the project, because of applicable standards for demolition 1-5, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

B. 321 Hamilton St. (LSHD) – Stan Bernshteyn, applicant. Replace existing windows as necessary; rebuild front porch, repair facade exterior siding and stucco-like material. Construct a 10’x15’ deck in the back of the home. Install sliding door at rear of the home. Replace roof asphalt shingles repair or replace existing fence. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-10] and [Demolition 1-5].

Stan Bernshteyn presented the application. The project includes: repairing damaged stucco and wood siding, replacing windows and doors, rebuilding the front porch and steps, replacing the asphalt shingle roof, adding a 10’ x 15’ deck in the rear of the property, adding sliding and French doors to access the deck. Also, repair of the fence on the east side of the alley, and adding an attic dormer with windows on the west elevation.

Chair Williams noted the drastic change to the windows. Cliff Town, architect, said there are several window styles, some are newer and others are older, some of them have grids, others don’t. To unify the appearance of the home all the new windows have grids (simulated divided lights). The existing windows don’t have any details. Commissioner Itle said that the front elevation windows and door appear to be original.

Chair Williams expressed concern with the replacement windows as proposed with the grids, being too much of a change for the simple house. Commissioner Dudnik concurred with Chair Williams’ concerns.

Chair Williams suggested simplifying the replacement windows by identifying with something that is original or minimize the grids. Commissioner Itle asked if possible restore the front door the window to the right of the front door and the French doors on the front elevation.

Commissioner Bady made a motion to continue the application for 321 Hamilton St. to the January 9, 2018 Preservation Commission meeting, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

C. 1015 Hinman Av. (LSHD) – Garry Shumaker, applicant. Replace front stoop with covered front porch to match existing bay above. Addition of railings to rear deck to match existing railings. Replacing second floor windows. Addition of second garage at alley with new fence. Addition of railings to rear deck, repair and paint exterior siding. Restoration of existing first floor windows in place. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-10]; [Construction - Garage 1- 4, 7, 8, 10- 13 and 16]; and [Demolition 1-5].

Garry Shumaker presented the application. The project includes replacing the non-original front concrete porch and metal canopy. In the rear, adding railings to the
existing deck to match existing porch on the side of the house. Also, replace some of the second floor windows; the first floor windows are being restored. Also, build a new garage, adjacent to the existing garage.

The second story sleeping porch triple track storm windows will be replaced with casement windows. On the south elevation, the 2 x 4 studs supporting the corner of the sleeping porch will be cladded with a lattice screen panel. On the north elevation, selected second floor windows will be replaced. Replacement windows are insert windows.

The proposed vinyl sided detached garage matches the existing garage in design and materials, with similar overhead garage doors, and a two panel solid wood door.

Commissioner Itle expressed concern with the proposed symmetrically centered front porch under the projecting bay.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to issue a COA for 1015 Hinman Avenue for the replacement of the front stoop front porch, railings, windows, restoration of windows, and other associated work with the applicable standards for alteration 1-10, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to issue a COA for 1015 Hinman Avenue for the addition of a second garage with standards for construction 1- 4, 7, 8, 10-13 and 16, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to issue a COA for 1015 Hinman Avenue for demolition of what is appropriate for the project, with standards for demolition 1-5, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

D. 2301 Sherman Av. (NEHD) – Douglas Ruther, Applicant. New 20’x24’ single-story family room addition at rear of house, and a new 12.5’ x 24’ deck. Install on the existing house 3 new window openings in the kitchen and dining room. [Alteration 1-10]; [Construction 1, 3, 5, 7, 8, 10, 12, and 13-15]; and [Demolition 1-5].

Douglas Ruther presented the application. The application is the construction of a 20’ x 24’ single story family room addition with a basement below and a new deck. The addition has the same materials of the main house. The existing windows on the house are Marvin insert clad windows, the addition will have the same windows. Three windows that are part of the main house will be replaced. An existing window on the first floor rear elevation will be re-used in the basement. The addition’s roof lower slope matches the main house eave slope, and the addition’s middle slope matches the main house roof slope. The middle ceiling is full height.
Chair Williams asked how the proposed roof shape on the addition came about. D. Ruther said the initial roof was a flat roof, a big box without high ceilings. The proposed roof shapes has high ceilings and follows existing slopes on the main roof.

Chair Williams said the house is a traditional Four Square house; the proposed roof shape does not work for the house. Commissioner Itle noted that every roof shape on the main house is a hip roof. Commissioner Dudnik concurred with previous comments and added that the circular window exacerbates the problem. Chair Williams suggested a gable roof instead.

Genevieve Pappas, owner, asked if a gable roof with an octagon or half circle window would it be acceptable. Commissioner Simon said that he was inclined to approve the project as is, based on the limited choices. Commissioner Dudnik said the Commission understands the rational that lead to the propose roof shape. The argument is what can be done at the second floor, or what can be done about the second story windows (at least not losing the light of those windows). Commissioner Reinhold said none of the suggested roof shape solutions seemed to solve the issue. Commissioner Schmitt said he liked the addition as is. Commissioner Itle said a hip roof is compatible; a gable roof is a deal breaker for him.

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to issue a COA for the project at 2301 Sherman Av. for the 20’ x 24’ single story family room addition at the rear of the house, as standards for alteration 1-10 are met, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion failed. Vote: 2 ayes, 4 nays, 1 abstention (Commissioner Simon).

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to issue a COA for the project at 2301 Sherman Av. for the 20’ x 24’ single story family room addition at the rear of the house, in standards for construction 1, 3, 5, 7, 8, 10, 12, and 13-15 apply, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion failed. Vote: 2 ayes, 4 nays, 1 abstention (Commissioner Simon).

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to issue a COA at 2301 Sherman Av. for demolition; in that standards for demolition 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion failed. Vote: 2 ayes, 4 nays, 1 abstention (Commissioner Simon).

Genevieve Pappas said she does not want a dormer on the addition, she would prefer a lower gable with a smaller window, if that would pass. Chair Williams suggested the applicant to submit a couple of options for the project.

**APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES** of October 17 and November 14, 2017.

Commissioner Reinhold made a motion to approve the October 17, and November 14, 2017 meeting minutes, seconded by Commissioner Schmitt. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 1 abstention (Chair Williams).
COMMITTEE REPORTS (Working Groups)

A. Preservation Ordinance Review / Rules and Procedures Subcommittee

Chair Williams informed the Commission that the Subcommittee met on December 14, 2017 to review the latest draft of the revised Preservation Ordinance. The next schedule meeting is January 4, 2018, when the Subcommittee plans to conclude its review of the Rules and Procedures.

Next Subcommittee meeting was scheduled to Thursday, January 4, 2018 at 8 am.

VOLUNTEER REPORTS

A. Design Guidelines Volunteers – No update

STAFF REPORTS

A. Adoption of 2018 schedule of EPC meetings

The EPC 2018 meeting schedule was unanimously approved 7-0. The 2018 Commission meetings are scheduled on the second Tuesday of the month and will be recorded. Meetings will be held in the City Council chambers. No meeting scheduled in August, 2018 (if necessary the Commission may schedule a special meeting). The September meeting may be re-scheduled due to Rosh Hashanah (September 11, 2018).

DISCUSSION (No vote taken)

A. Discussion on nomination of 2018 Preservation Commission Officers

The Commission discussed nominating and electing the Preservation Commission Officers at their next meeting on January 9, 2018.

ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 9:05 pm on Tuesday, December 19, 2017, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 7 ayes, 0 nays.

Respectfully submitted,

Carlos D. Ruiz
Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator

Next Meeting: TUESDAY, January 9, 2018 at 7:00 P.M. (Subject to change)