MEETING MINUTES
EVANSTON PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Tuesday, February 13, 2018,
Lorraine H. Morton Civic Center, 2100 Ridge Avenue, Room 2800
7:00 P.M.

Members Present: Robert Bady, Elliott Dudnik, Julie Hacker, Ken Itle, Jamie Morris, Tim Schmitt, Mark Simon, and Diane Williams,

Members Absent: Sally Riessen Hunt, Suzi Reinhold, and Karl Vogel

Staff Present: Scott Mangum, Planning & Zoning Administrator
Carlos Ruiz, Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator

Presiding Member: Dian Williams, Chair

CALL TO ORDER / DECLARATION OF QUORUM

The meeting was called to order at 7:06 pm with a quorum present

PUBLIC HEARING

A. 2010 Dewey Av. (Family Focus) – Nomination for Evanston landmark designation
[City staff recommends continuing the public hearing to March 13, 2018].

Commissioner Itle made a motion to open the public hearing for 2010 Dewey Av. seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed 7 ayes, 0 nays. (Commissioner Schmitt arrived after the vote was taken).

Chair Williams said that City staff has recommended to continue the hearing to March 13, 2018 at the request of Family Focus and that the applicant had agreed to the request.

Caterina Varvaro, Senior Vice President for Family Focus, owner of 2010 Dewey Av. said she was representing Family Focus.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to continue the public hearing for the nomination for landmark designation of 2010 Dewey Av. until the meeting of March 13, 2018, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.
OLD BUSINESS

A. 1239 Asbury Av. (L/RHD) – Michael Finnegan, applicant. Plat of subdivision to split Beth Emet The Free Synagogue from a single-family residence at 1239 Asbury Av. Major variation required to subdivide the synagogue property. The maximum building lot coverage in the R1 District is 30%. House property complies with 24%. The synagogue property is 32.3%; 32.7% is proposed. The maximum impervious surface coverage in the R1 is 45%. House property complies with 41%. The synagogue property is 63.8%; 65.1% is proposed. Major variation is required. The Preservation Commission’s review on the subdivision is advisory to City Council. The major variations are advisory to the Zoning Board of Appeals. Applicable standards: [2-8-12 (B) 1. (a) – (e) and (B) 2.], and [Zoning Variance 6-15-11-5 A, B, and C].

Michael Finnegan presented the application for the subdivision of 1239 Asbury Av. M. Finnegan said that five weeks ago he was in front of the Commission [with another subdivision proposal]. Since then, the Zoning Board of Appeals came up with a proposal to subdivide the lot, which has less variances, it would not require a curb cut, or parking pad or driveway. Instead of dividing the lot in half, it will be divided lengthways. The lot is now larger, but it will keep the garage intact. The two variations under consideration are existing conditions.

Scott Mangum said the change since the last time was to reconfigure the proposed subdivision of the lot, so it narrows the frontage on Asbury Av. and connects the lot all the way back to the alley. It eliminates the need of a new curb cut off of Asbury Av., which likely would have removed a mature tree; it also eliminates an additional driveway and parking pad or garage. It will limit the impervious coverage slightly, and it connects all the way to the alley, so the existing garage can be reused for the property. And it has the benefit of preserving a landmark property. The congregation has the intent to market the property for use as single-family residence.

No discussion ensued. Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a favorable recommendation to City Council for the subdivision of the property as described, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to provide a favorable recommendation to the Zoning Board of Appeals for the major variations, with the Preservation Ordinance applicable standards 2-8-12 (B) 1. (a) – (e) and (B) 2, and Zoning Ordinance for Zoning Variance 6-15-11-5 A, B, and C, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

NEW BUSINESS

A. 321 Lake St. (LSHD) – Corinne Rocca, applicant. Replace six basement and two above grade steel windows with Fibrex windows. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-10]; [Demolition 1-5].
Denise Vaske of Home Depot said they are replacing six basement fixed steel windows with the Andersen Fibrex slide windows. None of all the windows are egress windows.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to approve a COA to replace six basement and two above grade steel windows with Andersen Fibrex windows, in accordance with applicable standards of alteration 1-10, seconded by Commissioner Itle. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to approve a COA for demolition by removal of the existing windows to be replaced, in accordance with applicable standards of demolition 1-5, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

B. 1023 Michigan Av. (LSHD) – Christopher Winslow, applicant. Construct a one-story mudroom on south side elevation of existing addition. Applicable standards: [Construction 1, 3, 7, 8, 10 and 12-15]; [Demolition 1-5].

Chris Winslow, owner, said in 2007 they made an addition that the original plan called for a first floor mudroom, which subsequently was not built, except for the foundation. They would like to complete the construction of the mudroom at the back of the house as it was originally designed by Stephen Knutson, architect.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to issue a COA for 1023 Michigan Av. to construct the 1-story mudroom at the south side of the existing rear addition, in that the applicable standards of construction 1, 3, 7, 8, 10 and 12-15 apply, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to issue a COA for demolition [as required] for 1023 Michigan Av. in that the applicable standards of demolition 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

C. 1625 Judson Av. (LSHD) – Mark Shapiro, applicant. Restore windows, moldings cornices and siding. Relocate one window and remove seven windows, replace three double hung windows at the attic with casement windows. Provide new metal guard rail at the top of the existing parapet wall of second floor balcony rear elevation. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-10]; [Demolition 1-5].

Mark Shapiro and Sergei Safonov presented the application. Mark Shapiro said all the front façade windows are being restored and some of the windows on the side facades will be removed. On the first floor south side elevation, a triple window will be removed, one of those double hung windows will be restored and reused, and the remaining window opening will be filled in with siding to match the existing. The existing double hung window under the attic gable will be removed and replaced with a casement window (with modified Colonial grilles) to satisfy egress requirement.

At the rear east façade, all windows will be restored, except the two double hung windows under the gable will be replaced with slightly larger casement windows (with the modified
Colonial grilles) to satisfy egress requirement. On the second floor a wrought iron guard rail is being added to the existing balcony wall to satisfy guardrail code requirement.

On the north side elevation, some windows will be removed and the opening closed off with siding to match the existing, to provide cabinets and a stove in the kitchen. One window on the second floor will be removed.

Commissioner Hacker said the new replacement casement windows should be all wood rather than clad to match the windows being restored with simulated divided lights (SDL). Commissioner Dudnik said the lower horizontal muntin on the casement windows should be wider to match the look of a double hung window.

Commissioner Hacker made a motion to approve a COA for 1625 Judson Av. with the new casement windows as wood with SDLs, and to mimic the double hung windows that the bottom muntin will be wider; with applicable standards for demolition 1-5, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Hacker made a motion to approve a COA for 1625 Judson Av. for demolition of some of the existing windows, with applicable standards for alteration 1-10, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

D. 710 Forest Av. (LSHD) – David Cornes, applicant. Remove existing rear wood deck and replace with 2 level deck. From existing rear addition: remove fireplace and chimney, add in its place French doors facing the rear yard, remove dormer window and replace with larger fixed window. South elevation, first floor: Remove two existing windows and replace with casement windows. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-10]; [Construction 7, 10 and 12 -15] and [Demolition 1-5].

David Cornes, architect and Wendy Fox, owner, presented the application to remove an existing deck addition, replace with new deck, remove a fireplace and book cases, replace that with French doors. In that same room (south elevation), replace 4 casement windows with larger casement windows. On the north elevation remove the 2x2 balusters and stucco newel post, and replace with 6x6 posts and a cable railing system. Windows will match the existing windows on the house and the trim.

Commissioner Hacker referring to the horizontal bands of trim said the new windows should sit on top the string course, and the one window above the four new doors at the rear should be scaled down. Commissioner Ittle said the south elevation new casement windows with 3 divisions are not compatible with the existing 4/1 double hung windows. Commissioner Dudnik said the proposed stainless steel railing is not compatible with the style of the house.

Wendy Fox said the metal railing opens up the exterior of the house; an all wood railing would be too heavy. Commissioner Dudnik said the six stucco posts would be lost.
Commissioner Itle said he was less concerned about the deck and made a motion to issue a COA for 710 Forest Av. with changes as follows: on the west elevation, the window in the dormer area above the back room, that would be reduced in height, so it fits above the horizontal trim band, the new windows on the south elevation would be modified, so that they fit within the existing horizontal trim bands (without interrupting the trim bands), and the horizontal muntins would be eliminated from the casement window sashes, on the west elevation the French doors would be single large panes of glass without the horizontal muntins, and standards for alteration 1-10 apply; Commissioner Bady seconded the motion. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 2 nays (Dudnik and Hacker).

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a COA for 710 Forest Av. with the changes as previously described for new construction, standards 7, 10 and 12-15 apply, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 2 nays (Dudnik and Hacker).

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a COA for 710 Forest Av. for the project as previously described, standards for demolition 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 6 ayes, 2 nays (Dudnik and Hacker).

E. 117 Kedzie St. (LSHD) – Matt Berry, applicant. Construct a new 1-story mudroom and 2nd-story dormer addition at rear of house. Applicable standards: [Construction 1, 3, 7, 8, 10, and 12-15]; [Demolition 1-5].

Matt Berry, owner-architect presented the application for the addition of two separate dormers and a mud room below at the rear of the house. The dormers roof slope matches the existing slope of the front dormer. The dormers overhang 3'-10.5" the exterior masonry wall for the appropriate square footage of the bedrooms and with four steel brackets below that would match the existing rafter ties. The proposed mudroom at the rear is below the existing window at the stairs landing. The sides of the new dormers will be cladded with cement shingles. The side wall window on the front elevation dormer remains.

Commissioner Hacker said the proposed rear dormers engulf the house and destroy the character of the gable house with a front dormer. The proposed dormers are so different in character, large and overhanging, and the small mudroom below, do not seemed to be in keeping with this simple house; it is a problem of the scale of these pieces.

Commissioner Itle suggested pulling back the dormers from the gutter line to cut the overhang in half. M. Berry said there are homes in the historic district that have overhang rooms that cantilever at the back of the house. Commissioners noted that seeing those examples perhaps would be useful. M. Berry said that he tried to minimize the scale of the dormers, but he needs the adequate space for the bedrooms. Expanding the footprint of the house is not an option financially or from zoning requirements.

Commissioner Simon moved to table the proposal for 117 Kedzie St. until March 13, 2018, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.
**F. 1224 Dempster St. (RHD) – Eric Eichler, applicant.**

A. Site improvements to provide a universally-accessible main entrance, as well as an accessible egress route and improved paving at existing east egress doors. Associated with this work are:

1. Demolition of existing concrete paving and steps, landscaped areas, and stone planter at the main entry, and replacement with new concrete paving, steps, and accessible ramp, stone planter and seat wall, and landscaped areas.
2. Demolition and replacement of existing paving, steps, planter, and landscaped areas at the east egress doors and replacement with new paving, steps, accessible ramp, and landscaped areas.

B. Building improvements to replace aged materials and add exterior openings, including:

1. The replacement of exterior doors to match existing at the main entry (north facade) and egress doors (east facade).
2. Removal of select area of east facade to accommodate addition of new windows for sanctuary (east facade).
3. Addition of an exhaust grill (south facade) to accommodate new toilet rooms.

Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-10]; [Construction 1-7 and 9 - 16]; Demolition [1-5]

Eric Eichler and David Lawrie presented the application for exterior work as part of interior renovations. On the north elevation: replace the entry doors in kind; replace the concrete ramp and stairs for accessibility, adding seat walls and landscaping. On the east elevation: add a new ramp and the two doors and panels will be replaced, and add new windows to the right of the doors. On the south elevation: a new exhaust for the bathrooms inside.

David Lawrie said the building has sandblasted limestone and sandblasted façade. The new ramp and the walls are sandblasted concrete. The ramp slope on Dempster St. uses the topography of the land. Salvaged stone will be placed in storage for future use. The stairway handrails will be salvaged or replicated.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to issue a COA for 1224 Dempster St. for site improvements to the main entrance and as described in the proposal above, in accordance to the applicable standards for alteration 1-10, seconded by Commissioner Iltle. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to issue a COA for 1224 Dempster St. for construction of the improvements as described, in accordance to construction standards 1-7 and 9 - 16, seconded by Commissioner Iltle. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to issue a COA for demolition for 1224 Dempster St. for the improvements that are being replaced, in accordance to applicable standards for demolition standards 1-5, seconded by Commissioner Iltle. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

**G. 550 Judson Av. (L/LSHD) – Garry Shumaker, applicant.** Removal of broken skylights on south-facing first floor roof, two replaced and one filled in, removal of two double-hung windows on south house elevation to be filled in around two new awning windows
with matching diamond grille to match existing windows on front elevation, Demolish existing 1-car garage and construct new 2-car garage. Requires zoning variations: The maximum building lot coverage in the R1 district is thirty percent (30%). Existing (32.95%); proposed (35.83%). The maximum impervious surface ratio for the R1 district is forty-five percent (45%). Existing (45.8%); proposed (49.3%). Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-7, 9 and 10]; [Construction 1- 5, 7- 13 and 16]; [Demolition 1-5]; [Zoning Variance A and C].

Garry Shumaker presented the application to replace two of three skylights on the roof; the third skylight will be infilled. The existing windows remain, except the removal of two non-original windows on the kitchen side, and the installation of two awning windows below replicating the existing grille pattern and infilling the remaining openings in stucco to match the existing. The application asks for the demolition of the existing 1-car garage and the construction of a 2-car clapboard garage at the rear. The Zoning variance is necessary because of the undersized lot. A proposed rock garden will address the impervious area.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to issue a COA for 550 Judson Av. for the removal of skylights and replacement of two windows on the south elevation, under the applicable standards of alteration 1-7, 9 and 10, seconded by Commissioner Itle. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to issue a COA for 550 Judson Av. for the construction of the 2-car garage, under the applicable standards of construction 1- 5, 7- 13 and 16, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to issue a COA for 550 Judson Av. for the demolition of the 1-car garage, under the applicable standards of demolition 1- 5, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to recommend to the Zoning Board of Appeals approval of the required zoning variations for 550 Judson Av. with applicable standards for variance A and C, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays. Commissioner Dudnik amended his motion to recommend approval of lot coverage and impervious surface, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

H. 711 Judson Av. (LSHD) – Roshan Patel, applicant. Front west elevation: replace two windows on second story. Side north elevation: remove two double hung windows and install new window on the first floor and a tall window from the first floor from the second floor. New 1 story frame addition to the south side of existing home. Demolition of an existing covered 2 story porch on east (rear) side of home and construction of a new 2 story frame addition on east (rear) side of home. Demolition of existing 1 story garage and construction of new 2 story 3 car frame garage. The maximum building lot coverage in the R1 district is thirty percent (30%) Seeking a minor variance for proposed building lot coverage of 33.2%. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-10]; [Construction 1- 5, 7, 8 and 10- 16]; [Demolition 1-5]; [Zoning Variance A and C]
Roshan Patel presented the application to construct a 1-story addition on the south side of the home, and a 2-story frame addition on the east side, and removing the rear sun porch.

On the front elevation the porch columns brick detail will be replaced with limestone (same size and projection) and a wood trim will be added under the roof eave on the front façade and all around.

Chair Williams said the brick detail should be retained. Commissioner Hacker said adding new trim is not necessary. Regarding the 1-story east stucco addition with wood detailing Commissioner Itle said replicating the masonry detail does not translate into wood. Commissioner Itle noted that the house has minimal detail. The new porch emphasizes the vertical rather than the horizontal lines.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to continue the project at 711 Judson until March 13, 2018, seconded by Commissioner Hacker. The motion passed. Vote: 8 ayes, 0 nays.

**APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES of January 9, 2018.**

Chair Williams ask to acknowledge in the minutes Tim Schmitt’s email nomination of 2018 Commission officers.

Commissioner Bady made a motion to approve the January 9, meeting minutes as corrected, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed 5 ayes, 3 abstentions (Dudnik, Hacker and Schmitt).

**COMMITTEE REPORTS (Working Groups)**


The Commission discussed the proposed text amendments to the Preservation Ordinance. Commissioners agreed to provide staff with their comments with the goal to have all proposed amendments for consideration at the next meeting on March 13, 2018.

**VOLUNTEER REPORTS**

A. Design Guidelines Volunteers – Update

Commissioner Hacker said the Volunteers will look again at the design guidelines and give them to staff for posting them on the City’s website.
STAFF REPORTS

A. 2018 Preservation Awards

Carlos Ruiz informed the Commission that a call for nominations will be published shortly. He prepared for the Commission a list of projects from 2016 and will have one for 2015. The Preservation awards are held during National Preservation Month in May.

B. 2018 CLG Grant opened for applications

Carlos Ruiz informed the Commission that the CLG Grant is due March 15, 2018. The City will apply for funding for the Commission Assistance and Mentoring Program (CAMP).

DISCUSSION (No vote will be taken)

No discussion.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 9:56 pm.

Respectfully Submitted,

Carlos D. Ruiz
Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator