MEETING MINUTES
EVANSTON PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Tuesday, March 13, 2018,
Lorraine H. Morton Civic Center, 2100 Ridge Avenue, Room 2800
7:00 P.M.

Members Present: Elliott Dudnik, Julie Hacker, Ken Itle, Jamie Morris, Suzi Reinhold, Tim Schmitt, Mark Simon, Karl Vogel and Diane Williams,

Members Absent: Sally Riessen Hunt and Robert Bady

Staff Present: Scott Mangum, Planning & Zoning Administrator
Carlos Ruiz, Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator

Presiding Member: Diane Williams, Chair

CALL TO ORDER / DECLARATION OF QUORUM

The meeting was called to order at 7:07 pm with a quorum present

PUBLIC HEARING

A. 2010 Dewey Av. (Family Focus) – Nomination for Evanston landmark designation [continued from February 13, 2018].

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to open the public hearing for 2010 Dewey Av. Nomination for landmark designation, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion passed unanimously. Vote: 9 ayes, 0 nays.

Morris (Dino) Robinson Jr., nominator, highlighted in his presentation the following:

The nomination meets standards 2, 6 and 10 of the Preservation Ordinance, Section 2-4-8:

2. Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the historic, cultural, architectural, archaeological or related aspect of the development of the City of Evanston, State of Illinois, Midwest region, or the United States;
6. Its association with important cultural or social aspects or events in the history of the City of Evanston, the State of Illinois, the Midwest region, or the United States; and

10. Its exemplification of a pattern of neighborhood development or settlement significant to the cultural history or traditions of the City of Evanston, whose components may lack individual distinction.

Mr. Robinson noted that the structure at 2010 Dewey St. embodies a sense of community that has stood over a century in Evanston. It serves a particular segment of the Evanston community as a school, as symbol of social change and currently a place for social services. As a former Foster School, it has educated generations of Evanston residents who have made significant local, national and global contributions to society.

It later evolved to the Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. Experimental School, serving as a model for innovative teaching, and social changes during the 1960s, specifically desegregating schools in Evanston. As Family Focus, a social service center, the structure pioneered programming that has had a lasting effect in the community it serves.

The original 1905 structure was designed by Ernest Woodyatt, an Evanston resident, that stood until a fire gutted the structure in 1958. A 1926 addition by architects Childs & Smith added more classrooms, a theater and gymnasium. The 1961 addition replaced the original 1905 structure after it suffered a catastrophic fire.

In considering the designation, the nomination references the 1996 study supported by the Evanston Community Development Block Grant (Is this federal CDBG funds? If so, should read 'a Community Development Block Grant through the City of Evanston.') to create a West Evanston Conservation District (Reid Mackin, 1996). The study resulted in formation of the work group known as Preserving Integrity Through Culture and History (PITCH).

The work of PITCH encompassed four long-term goals:
• To establish a maintain a West Evanston Conservation District (WECD)...
• To amend the Evanston Historic Preservation Ordinance to allow…?projects affecting the WECD
• To encourage increased involvement in historic preservation issues…?by residents of the WECD
• To raise visibility of the cultural, historic, and architectural resources, sites and structures of the WECD

The history of Evanston mirrors the history of the nation. It did practice, early on in its history, the system of Jim Crow, where Foster School became the de facto segregated school in Evanston. Many interesting students attended Foster School. Some of these individuals are:

**Junior Mance**: Jazz pianist, released over 40 albums.
**Dorothy (Hadley) Bayen**: War Correspondent in support of Ethiopia. Co-Founder of the *Ethiopian Star Newspaper* and the Ethiopian World Federation.

**Fred Hutcherson**: Aviator. Joined the Royal Canadian Air Force. Ferried bombers overseas to England during WWII. Instructor for Tuskegee Airmen.

**William Logan**: First African American Police Chief.

**Sanders Hicks**: First African American Fire Chief. Founder of the Evanston Speed Skating Club. First coach for Olympic medalist in speed skating, Shani Davis.

**Iva Caruthers**: General Secretary of Samuel DeWitt Proctor Conference, which engages progressive African-American faith leaders in social justice issues.

**Joseph Hill**: First African American Assistant Superintendent of school district 65 and later Superintendent.


**Leon Robinson Jr.**: Entrepreneur, Robinson Bus Company and later Robinson Enterprises with real estate holdings across the United States.

In closing Dino Robinson, Jr. said the building was the base for community development and the base for home and engagement in the community. It operated as a school, and as it grew, became an experimental school, introduced busing from other schools, and launched the ‘in school lunch program’. As the home of Family Focus it engages in their innovative programming and social services. Is by this and with the spirit of the PITCH work for developing the West End Preservation District, and honoring this historical aspect Not sure what this last sentence means?

**Public Comment:**
Kristian Harris, Mary McWilliams, Al Gibbs, former Ald. Delores Holmes spoke in support of the nomination.

**Owner’s Remarks:**
Bridget O'Keefe, attorney for Family Focus, the property owner, said Family Focus leases seven sites to provide their services. The only asset Family Focus owns? is the building at 2010 Dewey Av. They invested over $2 million dollars in its upkeep, and every year FF or the building or both? runs a deficit in terms of its operation. At this point, Family Focus does not support the designation. However, they would like to request more time to discuss this issue with the neighborhood and the community and ask for 120 days extension to do so.
Dino Robinson did not object to the extension request, after learning from the Commission that the property is protected until a final decision is made on the nomination.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to continue the public hearing on the nomination of 2010 Dewey Av. until July 10, 2018, seconded by Commissioner Itle. The motion passed. Vote: 9 ayes, 0 nays.

OLD BUSINESS

A. 117 Kedzie St. (LSHD) – Matt Berry, applicant. Construct a new 1-story mudroom and 2nd-story dormer addition at rear of house. Applicable standards: [Construction 1, 3, 7, 8, 10, and 12-15]; [Demolition 1-5].

At the request of the applicant, Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to continue 117 Kedzie St. until the April 10, 2018 Commission meeting, seconded by Commissioner Reinhold. The motion passed. Vote: 9 ayes, 0 nays.

B. 711 Judson Av. (LSHD) – Roshan Patel, applicant. Front west elevation: replace two windows on second story. Side north elevation: remove two double hung windows and install new window on the first floor and a tall window from the first floor from the second floor. New 1-story frame addition to the south side of existing home. Demolition of an existing covered 2-story porch on east (rear) side of home and construction of a new 2-story frame addition on east (rear) side of home. Demolition of existing 1 story garage and construction of new 2-story, 3 car frame garage. The maximum building lot coverage in the R1 district is thirty percent (30%) Seeking a minor variance for proposed building lot coverage of 33.2%. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-10]; [Construction 1- 5, 7-13 and 16]; [Demolition 1-5]; [Zoning Variance A and C]

Roshan Patel presented the application for 1-story frame addition to the south and adding a 2-story frame addition to the rear east facade of the 2.5-story single-family residence. Also, demolish the existing garage and build a 2-story 3-car garage on the same footprint as the existing garage. A Minor Zoning Variance is necessary for building lot coverage of 33.2%.

The revised front west and side south elevations of the addition show a reduce height to match that of the front porch, the height of the windows match the existing front porch windows, as well as the proportions. There is no added detail to the stucco addition and the roofline, and the roof line matches the existing front porch roof.

The revised 2-story rear addition on east elevation was kept simple with minimal detailing. The revised north elevation of the addition remained the same as previously proposed, as well as the alteration on the existing house north elevation.
The new 2-story garage windows on the second story of the west elevation carry the characteristics of the windows on the addition to the house. The garage doors style on the east elevation are to preserve and match the existing garage doors.

Commissioner Dudnik questioned the proportion of the staircase window on the north elevation. Commissioners Hacker and Itle suggested making the south addition in brick, rather than stucco to maintain the brick horizontal datum with the stucco above, or pull to the back of the fireplace of the south addition back to show the existing brick wrapping around the front and side elevations. Commissioner Itle asked to preserve original window on the curved bay on the front.

Chair Williams and Commissioner Dudnik agreed that the south addition was compatible with the house as revised. Commissioner Simon made a motion to issue a COA for 711 Judson Av. to alter the house as described in accordance to applicable standards for alteration 1-10; construction (including the porch) 1-5, 7-13 and 16; and demolition as described 1-5, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion passed. Vote: 7 ayes, 2 nays (Itle and Hacker).

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to issue a favorable recommendation to Zoning for the project at 711 Judson Av. in that the Zoning variances A and C are met, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote; 7 ayes, 2 nays (Itle and Hacker).

NEW BUSINESS


Jeanie Petrick presented the project demolish the existing garage and replace it with a new 2-car detached garage that reflects the style, proportions and materials of the 19th Century house. The proposed garage has the same proportions of the roofs, the shingles below the gable roof, the 4” horizontal siding, windows trim, and eave details as the house. The overhang over the north elevation is one foot deep.

Commissioner Reinhold made a motion to issue a COA for 1200 Judson Av. for the demolition of the existing garage and construction of the new 2-car detached garage; in accordance with applicable standards of construction 1, 3, 7, 8, 10, and 12-15 and demolition 1-5, seconded by Commissioner Hacker. The motion passed. Vote: 9 ayes, 0 nays.

B. 1303 Maple Av. (L) – Matt Pater, applicant. Requesting to remove all (444) original single-pane wood windows & replace with Quaker historic clad/wood double hung double-pane insulated windows with brick mold on a 52-unit apartment building. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-10]; [Demolition 1-5].
Matt Pater and Gary Davis presented the application for the replacement of 444 windows. The proposed replacement window is a Quaker historic clad/wood double hung/double-pane insulated windows with simulated divided lights (SDL). The ownership of the rental building looked at restoring the windows of all 52 rental units. Restoring the windows would require displacing the renters for 2-3 weeks; a difficult task to do.

The windows facing Dempster St. will be replaced with windows that will match the existing windows, including the glass size, the details around them. At the rear elevation, the existing windows are different. The clad/wood windows are proposed where the face brick is on the exterior façade. Quaker vinyl windows are proposed where the Chicago common brick façade is, including gangways and the north side of the building.

Gary Davis discussed the Quaker brick moulds that will closely match the existing, 7/8" muntins, and double and triple windows have the same trim in between.

Commissioner Hacker made a motion to approve a COA for 1303 Maple Av. for the removal of 444 single pane wood windows to be replace with Quacker historic clad double hung wood windows, double pane with SDLs on the front façade and face brick walls and on the common brick will be vinyl double hung windows without muntins, and suggesting that the lugs can be omitted, in that standards for alteration 1-10 and demolition 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Itle. The motion passed. Vote: 9 ayes, 0 nays.

C. 115 Dempster (L/LSHD) – Susan Sevcik, applicant. Removing existing terrace and front walk, install new paver walks, terrace, outdoor BBQ, fire pit and in ground pool, fence in front yard and utility screen. Zoning Variations: 6-4-6-3, Table 4-A Non-compliant: Swimming pools are permitted within rear yards; proposed pool is located within the front yard; 6-4-6-7-F-2-a Non-compliant: Fences are permitted in rear, interior side and street side yards, at least 3’ back from the front façade of the residence; proposed 4’ tall fence located within the front yard; 6-4-6-3, Table 4-A Non-compliant: Patios, detached from the residence, are permitted within rear yards; proposed patios are located within the front and street side yards. Applicable standards: [Construction 1 5, 7, 9, 10 and 12-15]; [Demolition 1-5]; [Zoning Variations A, B and C].

Andrew Otting presented the project for 115 Dempster St. to remove an existing terrace and front walk, install new paver walks, terrace, outdoor BBQ, fire pit and in ground pool, fence in front yard and utility screen. There is no back yard to this property, so the only way to have a traditional back yard is to have it on the front yard. The masonry wall surrounding the property is over 10’ tall. The new fence will be in the interior of the property. None of the new proposed features are visible from the public way.

The existing front yard walk will be redone in natural stone, and the terrace will be smaller. The Zoning Variance is for the pool and the pool fence. The hardship is that
there is absolutely no back yard to the property. Based on the position of the house and a variance for the driveway, the only way the owners could have a traditional back yard, is in the front of the property. The existing wall is 9’ to the base of the wall and an 18” balustrade above it. Other amenities include a fire pit, kitchen, fence, a spa, and a lattice screen for all the utilities.

There is an ornamental wrought-iron gate at the driveway on the west side of the property. None of the new features will be visible from the public way.

Carlos Ruiz reported that a resident [Mark Miller of 137 Burnham Pl.] expressed his concern with the pool and fence in the front yard. A. Otting maintained the proposed pool and fence will not be visible by the neighbors. Regarding the Zoning Variances, pools are not allowed on the front yard. However, they put all the setbacks that Zoning staff asked them to provide, if the pool were to be approved on the front yard. There is the fence to make the pool legal.

Commissioner Itle asked about the utilities equipment location. A. Otting said the equipment is on a concrete pad with the required setback and a 4’ lattice; it will not be visible from the public way.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a COA for the project at 115 Dempster St., including the removal of the existing terrace and front walk, and installation of new outside walks, terrace, outdoor BBQ, fire pit, pool, fencing and utility screening, and applicable standards construction 1 5, 7, 9, 10 and 12-15, and demolition 1-5 apply, seconded by Commissioner Reinhold. The motion passed. Vote: 9 ayes, 0 nays.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to the Zoning Board of Appeals the proposed work at 115 Dempster St, which requires any number of Variances associated with the fences, the patio and the pool, in relation to standards for Zoning Variations A and C, seconded by Commissioner Itle. The motion passed. Vote: 9 ayes, 0 nays.

APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES of February 13, 2018.

**Action:** Approved as corrected. Vote: 8 ayes, 1 abstention (Reinhold).

**COMMITTEE REPORTS (Working Groups)**

**A. Preservation Ordinance Review / Rules and Procedures Subcommittee - Update.**

Carlos Ruiz said that Mario Treto received edits and comments from Commissioners about the proposed Ordinance 29-O-18. Mario Treto, Assistant City Attorney, had indicated to City staff, that the language of some of the edits was adjusted, so that it would be consistent with the language in the City Code.

Commissioners agreed to submit to City staff additional minor edits or comments if necessary. City staff would incorporate them when appropriate and as needed.
Commissioner Simon made a motion to approve the re-written Ordinance as submitted, subject to final corrections (29-O-18 An Ordinance Amending Title 2, Chapter 8 of the Evanston City Code, “Historic Preservation”), seconded by Commissioner Ittle. The motion passed. Vote: 9 ayes, 0 nays.

The Commission’s recommendation will be brought to City Council for approval.

VOLUNTEER REPORTS

A. Design Guidelines Volunteers – Update

Carlos Ruiz reported that the links provided by the volunteers have been downloaded in the City’s website. The links will be available to the public after the volunteers take a look at the content. The volunteers will work on updating some of the Design Guidelines language to reflect the language in the re-written Preservation Ordinance.

8. STAFF REPORTS

A. 2018 Preservation Awards – Call for Nominations

Carlos Ruiz reported that the 2018 Preservation Awards call for nominations have been announced via City of Evanston Newsletter. The deadline for submission is April 2, 2018. A video of the awards presentation will be presented to City Council in May 2018.

B. 2018 CLG Grant Application Update

Carlos Ruiz reported that the CLG Grant application to host CAMP in Evanston in the fall of 2018 is at the City Manager’s office for his signature. The grant submission deadline is March 15, 2018.

DISCUSSION (No vote will be taken)

No discussion.

ADJOURNMENT

Action: The meeting was adjourned at 9:26 pm, on Tuesday, March 13, 2918.

Next Meeting: TUESDAY, April 10, 2018 at 7:00 P.M. (Subject to change)

Respectfully Submitted,

Carlos D. Ruiz
Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator