MEETING MINUTES
EVANSTON PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Tuesday, April 10, 2018,
Lorraine H. Morton Civic Center, 2100 Ridge Avenue, Room 2800
7:00 P.M.

Members Present: Robert Bady, Elliott Dudnik, Ken Itle, Jamie Morris, Mark Simon, and Diane Williams

Members Absent: Julie Hacker, Sally Riessen Hunt, Suzi Reinhold, Tim Schmitt, and Karl Vogel

Staff Present: Scott Mangum, Planning & Zoning Administrator
Carlos Ruiz, Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator

Presiding Member: Diane Williams, Chair

CALL TO ORDER / DECLARATION OF QUORUM

Chair Williams called the meeting to order at 7:04 pm with a quorum present.

OLD BUSINESS

A. 117 Kedzie St. (LSHD) – Matt Berry, applicant. Construct a new 1-story mudroom and 2nd-story dormer addition at rear of house. Applicable standards: [Construction 1, 3, 7, 8, 10, and 12-15]; [Demolition 1-5].

Ann and Matt Berry presented the application. M. Berry showed more detailed drawings illustrating the massing of the second story dormer addition and overhanging over the rear of the house. He noted that the house is located in the fringe of a multi-story building area. The house sits next to a side alley and a condo building. The house is one of the smaller houses in the area.

The second floor plan showed where the gable roof meets the interior vertical walls, thus reducing the ceiling height. The intent is to expand the ceiling height and floor area of the rear bedrooms (11’ x 11’).

Matt Berry showed photos in his neighborhood of houses having overhangs; some of them are similar to what is being proposed. Immediate neighbors are in support of the
addition and design including condo owners to the west and neighbors looking at the travel and seeing the entire addition.

Matt Berry showed other designs as the Commission had suggested at the February 2018 meeting. They would involve the demolition of the existing bathroom. He also studied extending into the stairway, resulting in a dormer extending across the width of the house. Ann Berry said that her husband worked diligently to conform to the standards for review.

Commissioner Dudnik said the applicants made the case for the proposed addition. Commissioner Bady made the motion to issue a COA for 117 Kedzie St. in that standards for construction 1, 3, 7, 8, 10, and 12-15 apply to construct a 1-story mudroom and a 2nd-story dormer addition at the rear of the house, as well as demolition standards 1-5. Seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed: 5 ayes, 1 nay (Commissioner Itle).

NEW BUSINESS

A. 1419 Lake St. (L) – Sebastian Koziura, applicant. Construction of new 2-car detached garage. Applicable standards: [Construction 1, 3, 7, 8, 10, and 12-15]

Sebastian Koziura presented the application. The house does not have a garage; the house in disrepair requiring extensive renovation in the inside. The proposed 2-car garage is 20’ x 25’ with storage space above complies with the required setbacks. The garage door faces the street, with an access door on the east. The garage double hung windows on the side, front and rear, mimic the double hung windows style on the house. The garage roof slope, wood siding and moldings mimic that of the house.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to issue COA for 1419 Lake St. for the construction of a new 2-car detached garage, in accordance to applicable for construction 1, 3, 7, 8, 10, and 12-15, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed 6-0.

B. 1236 Forest Av. (L/LSHD) – Garry Shumaker, applicant. Replace existing fixed screen panels of the sleeping porch with Marvin Ultimate clad casement windows and install (3) modular skylights over the existing sleeping porch. The existing asphalt membrane roof and aluminum gutters will be replaced with a built-up copper sheet/membrane and copper half round gutters. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-5, 9 and 10]

Garry Shumaker presented the application to replace existing wood screen panels with clad casement windows; the bracket details remain. The new windows are consistent with the existing windows on the house. The project includes adding a layer of roofing on the top and installing 3 modular low profile skylights on the higher portion of the roof.
Commissioner Bady made a motion to issue a COA for 1236 Forest Av. to replace existing fixed screen panels of the sleeping porch with Marvin Ultimate clad casement windows and install (3) modular skylights over the existing sleeping porch. The existing asphalt membrane roof and aluminum gutters will be replaced with a built-up copper sheet/membrane and copper half round gutters with applicable standards of alteration 1-5, 9 and 10, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed 6-0.

C. 114 Kedzie St. (LSHD) – Cameron Davis, applicant. Install (27) solar photovoltaic (PV) panels on the east and west roof of the home (modules are flush to the roof surface). Modules are as far away from the view on the street and alley as possible by shifting the array as far to the south as possible). Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-5, 9 and 10].

John Ailey presented the application. He showed photos of the house taken from Kedzie St. to illustrate the visibility or not of the proposed solar panels. The panels will not be visible from the east and front view. The panels will visible on the west elevation. The solar panels are 3" above roof plane. Chair Williams noted the panels are very evident as seen from the west alley.

John Ailey said the panels are in a dark color to absorb energy. J. Ailey said the plan is to using Comed electricity at night and save energy in the summer. Also, the SW panels could be removed. The panels have a 25 years warrantee.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to issue COA for 114 Kedzie St. for the installation of solar photovoltaic panels on the east and west roofs of the home, with modules roughly 3" thick on top of the roof plane; applicable standards of alteration 1-5, 9 and 10, seconded by Commissioner Itle. The motion passed 5 ayes, 1 abstention (Commissioner Simon).

D. 1218 Sheridan Rd. (L/LSHD) – Donna Welch, applicant. Remove existing slate roof and existing older cedar roof underneath. Install new ‘slateline’ shingle roof. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-6, 9 and 10].

John Potter presented the application. The 1901 house currently has a slate roof from the 1920s. Underneath is a cedar shake roof. The slate and flashing are not repairable. They received 3 bids: cedar shingles at a cost of $107,500; asphalt shingle slateline roof, flashing with copper, re-sheet the roof at a cost of $122,700; and slate roof at a cost of 180,000. The application is for the asphalt shingle slateline.

After discussion about the preferred material, Commissioner Itle said that an asphalt shingle with the appearance of cedar shingles, as what appears to be the original roofing material would be more appropriate than the slateline asphalt shingle.

Commissioner Itle made a motion to issue a COA for the roof replacement at 1218 Sheridan Rd. with the understanding that the new roof would be the architectural asphalt shingle intending to mimic a cedar shingle roof appearance, and applicable
standards for alteration 1-6, 9 and 10, seconded by Commissioner Morris. The motion passed 5 ayes, 1 nay (Commissioner Dudnik)

E. 708 Michigan Av. (LSHD) – Jenifer Vija, applicant. Rebuild front shed dormer to have a gable roof and to rebuild/enlarge shed dormers on rear with gable/shed combination roof to allow construction of 3-bedrooms and 2 baths, where 2 bedrooms and 1 bath currently exist. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-5, 9 and 10]; [Demolition 1-5]

DonnaLee Floetter presented the application. The project involves the front shed dormer to have a gable roof and to rebuild/enlarge shed dormers at the rear with gable/shed combination roof, allowing the construction of 3-bedrooms and 2 baths, where 2 bedrooms and 1 bath currently exist. The proposed front dormer is in stucco.

After some discussion about the front gable, Commissioner Dudnik said his preference would be a dormer with a gable roof. Commissioner Itle said the front gable with a shed roof and a taller ceiling would be more appropriate.

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to issue a COA for 708 Michigan Av. for rebuilding and enlarging the shed dormers at the rear with gable/shed combination roof to allow the construction of the bedrooms and baths; with the provision that the front dormer would either be a gable or a shed dormer, and enlarged to accommodate the master bath, and subject to review by no more than three Commissioners, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed 6-0.

F. 1431 Judson Av. (LSHD) - David and Julie Cutter, applicants. Construct a new one-story wood screened-in porch at existing open deck structure at rear of house. Minor variation requested for interior side yard setback on south side of property from 5 feet to 3.7 feet in line with existing home and deck. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-5, 8-10]; [Construction- Porch 1, 3, 5-8, 10, 12-15] and [Zoning Variation A and C]

Susan Regan presented the application for the construction on a 1-story wood screened-in porch at an existing open deck at the rear of the house. The addition requires a Minor Zoning variation on the side yard, for a 3.7 ‘setback is proposed, where a 5’ setback is required.

Commissioner Simon made a motion to issue a COA for 1431 Judson Av. for the construction of a new one-story wood screened-in porch at existing open deck structure at the rear of house, in accordance to applicable standards for alteration 1-5, 8-10, and for construction 1, 3, 5-8, 10, 12-15, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed 6-0.

Commissioner Simon made a motion for 1431 Judson Av. to issue a recommendation for approval of a Minor Zoning variation to change for interior side yard setback on south side of property from 5 feet to 3.7 feet in line with existing home and deck, with
Zoning variation standards A and C, seconded by Commissioner Dudnik. The motion passed 6-0.

**Margins on this one. G. 629 Foster St. (NEHD)** – Fernando Gertzenstein, applicant. Redesign of front facade and entry. The new design looks to create larger openings to bring in more natural light to the community spaces and reduce the demand for artificial lighting; by keeping the new modifications within the same proportions, heights, and materials. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-5, 9 and 10]; [Demolition 1-5]

Mike Shively, architect, presented the application. The project aims to bring additional light into the building. The existing front elevation displays squatty windows. The proposed elevation introduces transom windows plus a transom line, while matching the proportions of the existing windows. The 1st floor surrounds the height of the front doors and is enhanced with transom windows, matching the existing limestone sills.

The proposed front façade does not project further out and is complies with Zoning. Mike Shively said they had a neighborhood meeting with those who will see the change.

Commissioner Dudnik said the proposed front façade has the appearance of a 2-story greenhouse facing south. It takes away its residential scale. Commissioner Simon noted the proposed façade does not fit with the architecture of the neighborhood. Chair Williams noted the houses across the street are of a lower scale. The proposed front elevation seems much larger in scale, even to achieve its objectives. Commissioner Simon (I thought this was Elliott but they both may have said similar things.) said the test for the proposed front facade is whether the building is consistent neighborhood. This change is sharply different and no longer relates to the existing structures in the neighborhood.

Commissioner Itle said the existing front facade clearly went out its way to fit with the neighborhood. The new façade needs to maintain the residential scale, and there is no need to recladding the front façade mass. Commissioner Dudnik said the existing elegant detailing of front facade would be gone. Commissioner Morris agreed with the previous comments.

Commissioner Itle noted that the front façade could have larger openings, but with added detailing around the opening. Commissioner Dudnik said he would like to see all the building views affected by the project.

Commissioner Bady made a motion to defer 629 Foster St. until the May 8, 2018 meeting, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed 6-0.

4. **APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES of March 13, 2018.**

The March 13, 2018 meeting minutes will be approved at the May 8, 2018 meeting.
5. COMMITTEE REPORTS (Working Groups)


The Rules and Procedures final draft for approval will be on the May 8, 2018 meeting agenda for approval.

The text amendments of the Preservation Ordinance 29-O-18 are for introduction to City Council on April 23, 2018, and for action on May 14, 2018.

6. VOLUNTEER REPORTS

A. Design Guidelines Volunteers – Update

No report.

7. STAFF REPORTS

A. 2018 Preservation Awards – Update

Staff reported that 26 nominations were submitted. The projects site visit will take place on April 19th, the reception and awards program is on April 26th, and a video presentation of the site visits of the projects receiving the award will be presented to City Council on May 21, 2018.

8. DISCUSSION (No vote will be taken)

Chair Williams announced the Traditional Building Conference in Oak Park, April 24-26, 2018.

9. ADJOURNMENT

Commissioner Dudnik made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 9:00 pm on April 10, 2108, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed 6-0.

Respectfully Submitted,

Carlos D. Ruiz
Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator