3. NEW BUSINESS

D. PUBLIC HEARING

- 1225 Asbury Av. (RHD) – Matthew Fleming, owner/applicant. Nomination for landmark designation of the single family residence at 1225 Asbury Av. designed by George Schipporeit and built in 1978.
2-8-5 APPLICATION FOR NOMINATION OF AN AREA, PROPERTY, STRUCTURE, SITE OR OBJECT FOR DESIGNATION BY ORDINANCE AS A LANDMARK OR HISTORIC DISTRICT

(Please Print or Type and check applicable boxes. Attach additional 8-1/2 x 11" sheets as necessary)

☐ Historic District Nomination (for a historic district nomination submit a list for each property, structure, site or object within the proposed historic district with the information below):

☐ Landmark Nomination (for individual nomination of a property, structure, site or object submit the information below):

1. a) Street address of area, property, structure, site or object being nominated:

   Street #: 1225 Street Name: Asbury Ave
   City: Evanston State: Illinois Zip Code: 60202

   b) Real Estate Index Number: 11-19-100-035-0000 Zoning: Residential

   c) Original Architect/Contractor (if known): George Schipporeit

   Year Built (if known): 1978 Architectural Style: Modern

   d) Contributing significance (for historic district nomination only):

      ☐ Architectural ☐ Historical ☐ Archaeological ☐ Cultural

   e) Is it within an existing historic district? (Landmark nomination only) ☑ Yes ☐ No

      If yes: ☐ Lakeshore ☐ Ridge ☐ Northeast Evanston:

      NOTE: If the nomination is for an area, property, structure, site or object with no official street address, please indicate its location on the attached city map (for a district show the proposed boundaries).

2. a) Provide Legal Description of Nominated Property (for Individual landmark nomination only) or;

   b) Describe proposed boundaries (for historic district nomination only):

   OF THE SOUTH 60.0 FEET OF ENLARGE BLOCK A IN THE PLAT OF WINSTONS’ ENLARGED HOMESTEAD BLOCK A, BEING A CONSOLIDATION OF PARTS OF SECTION 19 TOWNSHIP 41 NORTH, RANGE 14, EAST OF THE THIRD PRINCIPAL MERIDIAN RECORDED IN DOCUMENT NUMBER 9739804 ON AUGUST 05, 1927 IN RECORDER’S OFFICE IN COOK COUNTY, ILLINOIS

3. Owner of record shall be established by reference to the most current property tax assessment rolls as maintained by the Assessor of Cook County.

☐ Historic District Nomination (for a historic district nomination submit a list for each property, structure, site or object within the proposed historic district with the information below):

☑ Landmark Nomination: for individual nomination of a property, structure, site or object, submit the information below):

   a) Name of owner(s) of record of area, property, structure, site or object being nominated:

      Matthew Fleming

      Phone #: 312-375-0413 Fax #: ___________________ E-mail: 4fpbwf7gaf@snkmail.com

   b) (Mailing address) Street #: 1225 Street Name: Asbury Ave

      City: Evanston State: Illinois Zip: 60202
4. Please submit complete information as required in the Evanston Historic Preservation Ordinance, Section 2-8-4: Criteria for Designation. Provide factual information as applicable for each single item listed in Section 2-8-4. You may include documents and photographs to emphasize the significance of the nominated area, property, structure, site or object for designation by ordinance as a landmark or historic district. Use 8-1/2” x 11” attachment sheets if needed.

2-8-4: CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION: Every nominated Landmark or District must meet two or more of the following specified criteria for designation.

(A) The Commission shall limit their consideration to the following criteria in making a determination on a nomination of an area, property, structure, site or object for designation by ordinance as a Landmark or Historic District.

1. Its location as a site of a significant historic or prehistoric event or activity which may or may not have taken place within or involved the use of any existing improvements on the property;
2. Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the historic, cultural, architectural, archaeological or related aspect of the development of the City of Evanston, State of Illinois, Midwest region, or the United States;
3. Its exemplification of an architectural type, style or design distinguished by innovation, rarity, uniqueness, or overall quality of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship;
4. Its identification as the work of an architect, designer, engineer, or builder whose individual work is significant in the history or development of the City of Evanston, the State of Illinois, the Midwest region, or the United States;
5. Its exemplification of important planning and urban design techniques distinguished by innovation, rarity, uniqueness or overall quality of design or detail;
6. Its association with important cultural or social aspects or events in the history of the City of Evanston, the State of Illinois, the Midwest region, or the United States;
7. Its location as a site of an important archaeological resource;
8. Its representation of a historic, cultural, architectural, archaeological or related theme expressed through distinctive areas, properties, structures, sites or objects that may or may not be contiguous;
9. Its unique location or distinctive physical appearance or presence representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community, or the City of Evanston;
10. Its exemplification of a pattern of neighborhood development or settlement significant to the cultural history or traditions of the City of Evanston, whose components may lack individual distinction.

(B) Integrity of Landmarks and Districts.

Any area, property, structure, site or object that meets any one or more of the criteria in Section 2-8-4(A) shall also have sufficient integrity of location, design, materials and workmanship to make it worthy of preservation or restoration.

5. a) Name of Applicant(s): Matthew Fleming
b) Phone: 312-375-0413 Fax: E-mail: 4fpbwf7gaf@snkmail.com
c) Mailing Address of applicant(s) Street #: 1225 Street Name: Asbury Ave
City: Evanston State: IL Zip: 60202
d) Applicant(s)’ Signature: ______________________________Date: 06/26/2018

Submit the nomination form to: Evanston Preservation Commission, 2100 Ridge Avenue, Evanston, IL 60201
For additional information contact: Carlos D. Ruiz (847) 448-8687, Fax: (847) 448-8120, E-mail: cruiz@cityofevanston.org
Landmark Nomination - 1225 Asbury

Prepared for: Carlos Ruiz, Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator
Prepared by: Matthew Fleming, Homeowner
June 26, 2018
(A) THE COMMISSION SHALL LIMIT THEIR CONSIDERATION TO THE FOLLOWING CRITERIA IN MAKING A DETERMINATION ON A NOMINATION OF AN AREA, PROPERTY, STRUCTURE, SITE OR OBJECT FOR DESIGNATION BY ORDINANCE AS A LANDMARK OR HISTORIC DISTRICT.

2. **Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the historic, cultural, architectural, archaeological or related aspect of the development of the City of Evanston, State of Illinois, Midwest region, or the United States;**

The house was designed and built by George Schipporeit. Mr. Schipporeit has contributed significantly to the City of Evanston. He designed the Chase Bank Tower at 1603 Orrington Ave, built in 1969. The tower is still the tallest building in Evanston. He also designed the Rotary International Building. He was also a resident of Evanston for quite some time.

3. **Its exemplification of an architectural type, style or design distinguished by innovation, rarity, uniqueness, or overall quality of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship;**

Mr. Schipporeit was a student of Ludwig Mies van der Rohe; our house exemplifies the ‘less is more’ motto of his former teacher. The entire makeup of the house is concrete, steel and glass, or as Mies might state ‘skin and bones’. The composition allows for almost impossibly large balconies for every bedroom and creates a bold rectilinear structure- a strong contrast to the Victorian neighborhood. The house has a distinct stuccoed exterior that seems to remind visitors of some other (non-American) place… we’ve heard South America, Germany, etc.

4. **Its identification as the work of an architect, designer, engineer, or builder whose individual work is significant in the history or development of the City of Evanston, the State of Illinois, the Midwest region, or the United States;**

Mr. Schipporeit was a professor at the Illinois Institute of Technology. He also is most well-known as the designer for Lake Point Tower, the only major building east of Lake Shore Drive in Chicago. He had strong ties to Evanston and Chicago.
(B) INTEGRITY OF LANDMARKS AND DISTRICTS. ANY AREA, PROPERTY, STRUCTURE, SITE OR OBJECT THAT MEETS ANY ONE OR MORE OF THE CRITERIA IN SECTION 2-8-4(A) SHALL ALSO HAVE SUFFICIENT INTEGRITY OF LOCATION, DESIGN, MATERIALS AND WORKMANSHIP TO MAKE IT WORTHY OF PRESERVATION OR RESTORATION.

Our home is in a very similar condition to its original design. There have been no additions to the house nor significant changes to the outside structure. Here is a picture of the front of the house from the mid 1980s.

Notice that other than the landscaping and the greenhouse, there are no material changes to the structure. You can see “today” on the cover of this application.
Here is the view toward the back of the house looking at the garage. Again no significant changes here, just the stucco finish, a sliding door to match the rest of the house and landscaping.
OBITUARY: GEORGE SCHIPPOREIT

Architect George D. Schipporeit was born on June 10, 1933 and died on August 29, 2013. He co-designed Chicago’s Lake Point Tower and two downtown Evanston buildings, among others.

George Schipporeit, age 80, of Glenview. Beloved husband of Alice Schipporeit, née Butler; loving father of John Beyer, Heidi (Greg) Peterson, Leslie Beyer, Marta, and the late Gregg Schipporeit; proud grandfather of Elizabeth Cornwell and Emily (Cameron) Jones; uncle of Kevin and George Meyer; brother of the Elaine (Al) Meyer and the late Dale Schipporeit; son of the late George and Ida Schipporeit.

Best-known as co-designer of Chicago’s 70-story Lake Point Tower (completed 1969), he was renowned as both architect and educator. Born in Huron, South Dakota and raised in Norfolk, Nebraska, beginning in 1955 he studied at Illinois Institute of Technology under famed landscape architect Alfred Caldwell. He then moved to the office of Mies van der Rohe, where he worked from 1957 to 1960. In 1963, working for New York developer Hartnett-Shaw, Inc., he began studies for what would become Lake Point Tower in collaboration with John Heinrich, an IIT classmate. In 1970 he formed Schipporeit, Inc., and realized several significant high-rise buildings, including the State Bank and Rotary International Buildings in Evanston, Illinois, and Atrium Village, 445 E. Ohio Street, and Asbury Plaza in Chicago. In 1980 he became Chairman of the Department of Architecture at IIT, and later served twice as Dean of the College of Architecture. After 1990 he continued at IIT as Associate Professor, and taught until his death. Continuing his lifelong interest in urban design and planning, in the early 2000s he established IIT’s Sustainable New Cities Specialization, a masters degree program of which he was Director. He won many awards, including an American Institute of Architects National Honor Award (1970) for Lake Point Tower, and the AIA’s Chicago Chapter 25-Year Award, also for Lake Point Tower, which honors "design of enduring significance."
OUR STORY SO FAR

Jolie and I both went to school at Northwestern University in the early 90s, graduating in 1996. From there we followed the ‘typical’ Chicago experience of moving toward the city with stints in Wrigleyville, Lakeview, Lincoln Park, and finally the West Loop. We moved back to Evanston in 2002 as the start of the plan to extend our family. We moved onto the 1700 block of Wesley into a house built in 1897. We spent the next 15 years there and did quite a bit of restorative renovation to the property (e.g. finished the basement, restored the garage, renovated the kitchens and all of the bathrooms).

We enjoyed our home on Wesley, however Jolie and I were always talking about “that really cool all-white modern house just before the bend on Asbury” (we lived North so it was just before). We hadn’t been into the house before but it quickly became our “if that house ever goes on the market, we need to see it” house. Late in the summer of 2017, a for sale sign appeared out in front of the house and we went to see it that very night. It was then that we started to learn about both the history and significance of the house (and its architect). The history of course made us love the house even more. By August of 2017 we were the proud owners of our dream house.

Like our house on Wesley, the previous owners had been in the house for quite some time and the kitchen and bathrooms were really dated. Some of the bathrooms still weren’t even finished after all this time. We decided to start renovation immediately, both updating of the kitchen and existing finished bathrooms as well as the completion of half-finished bathrooms.

For the renovation back on Wesley, the extent of the work qualified us for a Property Tax Assessment Freeze. We worked with the state and Evanston Historic Preservation program (with Carlos!) on our application and were approved. Similarly, the extent of the planned work for our new house qualifies for the same program. We started the application process with the state but, unlike our Wesley house, the 1225 Asbury house was not listed as ‘contributing’; our home was finished much later than the period of significance for the district.

It was pretty shocking that our house was not ‘contributing’ even though it was within a historic district and designed and built by a notable architect. We are applying for local designation now but will also be trying to get the home on the National Register. We think that given Mr. Schipporeit’s contributions to Evanston architecture, Chicago architecture and education (architecture professor at IIT), this home should be designated as a landmark.

LANDMARK NOMINATION - 1225 ASBURY
Hello Matthew:

I agree with you that the house is lovely! And of course, George Schipporeit was an important contributor to Chicago design and design education. I suspect the reason that the building was not listed as contributing to the historic district is because the date of construction is probably later than the end of the Period of Significance of the Historic District. I will direct you to Andrew Heckenkamp of our office (217-785-4324) regarding that, and also whether it might be a good candidate for individual listing on the National Register.

However, if you are interested in designation for the purposes of applying for our homeowner program, the Property Tax Assessment Freeze, local landmarking would also make your building eligible for that program. Carlos Ruiz (847-448-8687, cruz@cityofevanston.org) is the local staff person for the City of Evanston’s Historic Preservation Program. He could help you if you wish to pursue local designation.

I work with the tax incentives. Do you plan a renovation of the property? If you are potentially interested in the Property Tax Assessment Freeze Program, https://www2.illinois.gov/dnrhistoric/Preserve/Pages/taxfreeze.aspx please call me at 217-524-0276 right away so we can discuss the parameters of the program and what our design review would consist of. It is different than the city’s landmark review on the exterior (if you go for local landmarking) and also includes the interiors of buildings. Congratulations on purchasing such a unique and beautiful home!

Thanks, Carol

Carol J. Dyson, AIA
Tax Incentives Manager
Deputy State Historic Preservation Officer
Lake Point Tower
505 North Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, IL 60611
LANDMARK NOMINATION - 1225 ASBURY

Orrington Plaza (Chase Bank Tower)
1603 Orrington Ave, Evanston IL 60201
One Rotary Center
1560 Sherman Ave, Evanston IL 60201
Asbury Plaza
750 North Dearborn St, Chicago IL
LANDMARK NOMINATION - 1225 ASBURY

Atrium Village Apartment Building
300 West Hill Street, Chicago IL
1225 Asbury Ave
Evanston, IL 60202

Back Yard View
Interior Living Room View (facing back yard)
D. PUBLIC HEARING

- 2305 Brown Av. (L) – Carol Lems-Dworkin, owner/applicant. Kristin Lems (Power of Attorney). Application for rescission of landmark designation of the property at 2305 Brown Av. built in 1908, home of Henry Butler a prominent and successful African American businessman. Mr. Butler lived in the home from 1912-1937. The Statement of Significance cites criterion H3 Be associated with a nationally, regionally or locally prominent person or organization; deceased 25 years
CITY OF EVANSTON PRESERVATION COMMISSION
2100 Ridge Avenue, Evanston, IL 60201
(847) 448-8687

APPLICATION FOR AMENDMENT/RESCSSION BY ORDINANCE OF DESIGNATION AS A
LANDMARK OF AN AREA, PROPERTY, STRUCTURE, SITE OR OBJECT

(Please print or type and check applicable boxes. Attach additional 8-1/2 x 11" sheets as necessary)

1. Amendment/Rescission of Landmark Status
   a) Street address of area, property, structure, site or object being amended/rescinded:
      Street #: 2305 Street Name: Brown
      City: Evanston State: IL Zip Code: 60201
   b) Real Estate Index Number: 10-12-309-054-0000 Zoning: __________
   c) Original Architect/Contractor (if known): No architect, Henry Butler, construction permit
      Year Built (if known): 1908 Architectural Style: one story brick
   d) Original contributing significance: [ See Attachment 1 and Statement of Significance if available]
      Architectural Historical Archaeological Cultural
      ☑ (H3) locally prominent person deceased 25 years
   f) Is it within an existing historic district? Yes ☐ No ☑
      If yes: Lakeshore ☐ Ridge ☐ Northeast Evanston ☐ Thematic Apt Bldgs.

NOTE: If the amendment/rescission is for an area, property, structure, site or object with no official street
address, please indicate its location on the attached city map.

2. Provide Legal Description of landmark Property (use attachment if necessary)
   2018 Plat of survey attached

3. Owner of record shall be established by reference to the most current property tax assessment
   rolls as maintained by the Assessor of Cook County.

Submit the information below:

Owner's Name: Carol Lems-Dworkin
Mailing Address: Street #: 7000 Street Name: N. McCormick Blvd. #435
City: Lincolnwood State: IL Zip: 60712
Phone: 773-865-0393 (daughter) E-mail: kristinlems@yahoo.com (POA)
Owner's Signature: __________________________ Date: __-__-__

Owner's Name: Carol Lems-Dworkin
Mailing Address: Street #: 7000 Street Name: N. McCormick Blvd. #435
City: Lincolnwood State: IL Zip: 60712
Phone: 773-865-0393 (daughter) E-mail: kristinlems@yahoo.com (POA)
Owner's Signature: __________________________ Date: __-__-__
CAROL LEMS, a single mother of 2 and music professor at Kendall College, bought and moved into 2305 Brown in 1965. It was unoccupied at the time. She remarried in 1966 and became widowed after her husband’s tragic heart attack in late 1967. She and her daughters moved back in 1968, and Lems-Dworkin’s job was downsized a few years later, requiring her to work 3 part time jobs. Living alone, she taught piano lessons there and qualified for many years for the Senior low income tax freeze. In 2017, after several serious falls, she was required to leave her beloved house. We ask the commission to rescind the house’s landmark status, which she obtained in 1978 with an “H3” designation, because we believe it was largely a personal project of Lems-Dworkin only and no longer meets the criteria for designation in Section 2-8-4. The request is time dated, as the sale of the home is the only asset that will fund her increasingly serious health care expenses.

Our mom did her utmost to maintain the home over the years, and any minor violation from periodic inspections was quickly remediated. Because of her low income, she was forced to apply for three different housing rehab loans from the city, for which we were very grateful. With the loans, she repaired the fence, replaced the flat roof, removed diseased trees, painted, and repaired the porch. Up to summer 2017, all items were fully fixed. However, her low income status, advancing age, and single occupancy have resulted in gradual degradation to the house, reducing both its integrity and relevance. An inspection and report in June 2018 by structural engineer M. Calamaro concludes, “The structure appears to be in such poor condition that I can’t imagine there is any economic value to try and salvage it.” (attached) The real estate listing placed in 2018 puts it best: “needs everything.”

To address rescission, as specified in the 1994 Ordinance, we address each criterion individually:

1. Its location as a site of an event or activity that is significant to the broad patterns of history of the City, State, Midwest region, or the United States, which may or may not have taken place within or involved the use of any existing improvements on the property:

   For 50 years, 2305 Brown was occupied exclusively by Carol Lems-Dworkin (and for a short time, by her daughters). As a widow living alone, she taught piano in her home and led a quiet, private life. There were 5 previous owners before Lems-Dworkin purchased the property, and the home was unoccupied when she purchased it. The home was not host to any important significant events in the history of the city; it was strictly residential and of no special status.

2. Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the historic, cultural, architectural, archaeological or related aspect of the development of the City, State, Midwest region or the United States:

   Carol Lems-Dworkin got interested in local history and applied for landmark status to honor black entrepreneur Henry Butler, who lived in the home with his wife 1912-1937. Her article about Butler was published in 2007 in Shorefront Magazine. Her interest in the Butler family was a personal hobby and did not result in any events, projects, partnerships, or other impacts on the neighborhood, the community, or the city. Butler “bought considerable real estate in the city,” including houses on Judson, Emerson, and Maple (9/30/23 Chicago Defender), but he did not own 2305 Brown. It was owned by Margaret Fisher, a Scottish nurse. Butler applied to build a chicken coop behind the house in 1909, but did not submit any other permits to expand or improve upon the property.

   Except for Lems-Dworkin’s personal interest, no association has been made between the house and Henry Butler for more than 80 years, and no parties have expressed any interest in the house.

3. Its exemplification of an architectural type, style, design, or type of construction distinguished by innovation, rarity, uniqueness or overall quality of design, detail, materials or craftsmanship:

   Lems-Dworkin submitted an application to add the architectural features of the home to its landmark status in 1983,
and the Historic Preservation Commission turned it down.

4. Its identification as the work of an architect, designer, engineer, developer, or builder whose individual work is significant in the history or development of the City, the State, the Midwest region or the United States:

The building permit lists the owner as Margaret Fuller and the builder as Henry Butler. He was not an architect, and no architect is listed.

5. Its exemplification of important planning and urban design techniques distinguished by innovation, rarity, uniqueness or overall quality of design or detail:

2305 Brown is a very small, utilitarian, one story brick house. It cannot be called “important” in innovation, rarity, uniqueness, or overall quality of design or detail.

6. Its association with important cultural, social, political, or economic aspects or events in the history of the City, the State, the Midwest region or the United States;

2305 Brown was not associated with important events or movements in the history of Evanston or beyond. The wish for a landmark house was a personal project of Carol Lems-Dworkin. The home had been unoccupied for some time when she saw it in 1965.

7. Its location as a site of an important historic or prehistoric archaeological resource:

The property has no archaeological significance.

8. Its representation of an historic, cultural, architectural, archaeological or related theme expressed through distinctive districts, sites, buildings, districts, structures, or objects that may or may not be contiguous.

2305 Brown is not part of any historic district, either local, state, or federal. It is not on the national register of historic places.

9. Its unique location or distinctive physical appearance or presence representing an established and familiar visual feature of a neighborhood, community or the City;

Since the house was built before 1960, it has been grandfathered to allow a tall fence at the front of the property and a flat roof. These features predated the landmark status and would presumably continue to be grandfathered. Over time, due to limited financial resources, the owner has been unable to improve the property. We hope rescinding the status will inspire attractive improvements based on the general zoning requirements of the city.

10. Its exemplification of a pattern of neighborhood development or settlement significant to the cultural history or traditions of the City, whose components may lack individual distinction.

We are not aware of any neighborhood development or settlement connected to, or based upon, anything related to this house; the lot is less than ¼ acre in size, the house is in poor condition, and it represents only the owner’s limited best efforts over half a century.

submitted by
Kristin Lems, 221 – C Dodge Ave., Evanston 60202
Martha Rosenberg, 1820 Asbury #3, Evanston 60201

1. Its exemplification of a pattern of neighborhood development or settlement significant to the cultural history or traditions of the City, whose components may lack individual distinction.

(B) Integrity of Landmarks and Districts. Any district, site, building, structure, or object that meets any one or more of the criteria in Subsection 2-8-4(A) shall also possess sufficient integrity of location, design, setting, materials workmanship, feeling, and association to convey its
5. **Name of Applicant(s)**

Owner's Name: Carol Lems-Dworkin
Mailing Address: Street #: 7000, Street Name: N. McCormick Blvd., #435
City: Lincolnwood, State: IL, Zip: 60712
Phone: 773-855-0383 (daughter), E-mail: kristniems@yahoo.com (POA)

Owner's Signature: ___________________________ Date: 1-28-18
Ms. Kristin Lems  
221 C Dodge Ave.  
Evanston, IL 60202-3667

June 7, 2018

RE: 2305 Brown Avenue  
Evanston, Illinois

Dear Kristin,

At your request, I met you on June 6, 2018 at the house located at 2305 Brown Ave., Evanston, Illinois. The purpose of our meeting was for me to review and offer my opinions and recommendations in regard to the structural conditions of the house at the above referenced address. Drawings for the house were not available during the observation. No testing or removal of finish material was done during the observation. The following is a summary of my observations and recommendations:

1. The house was built circa 1908. It is a one-story structure with a flat roof and a lower level/basement (see picture #1 for overall view looking northeast, picture #2 of the front porch, picture #3 of the rear/east elevation and picture #4 for the enclosed rear porch at the southeast corner of the house). The exterior walls are constructed with masonry including the foundation walls. The floor is constructed with wood joists (2"x8" spaced at 16" o.c.) spanning in the north to south direction supported by 6"x8" wood beams spanning in the east to west direction. The wood beams are supported by three masonry piers and the exterior masonry walls.

2. The masonry exterior and foundation walls are in poor condition. Efflorescence is visible throughout (see for example pictures #5 and #6). To repair the masonry walls, tuck pointing and painting the walls was used in the past (see picture #7). To properly repair the exterior masonry walls for long term durability, the following work is needed:
   a. The exterior face of the foundation walls will have to be exposed down to the footings so damaged/deteriorated masonry units can be replaced, the mortar joists can be properly tuck pointed (grinding the joints) and the walls then can be re-waterproofed.
   b. All the interior surfaces of the masonry walls at the basement level need to be repaired similar to item #a above (waterproofing is not required).
   c. The paint from all the masonry walls’ surfaces need to be removed so the walls can be repaired similar to item #b above. The interior surfaces of the first-floor exterior masonry walls should similarly be repaired due to many cracks in the plaster finishes, mold and mildew in the walls and poor lintels over windows (see items #d and item #3 below).
   d. The headers/lintels above windows are not properly constructed (see pictures #8 and #9). The wood members supporting the masonry above the windows have collapsed and the headers in front of the masonry walls are lacking metal hangers and are supported at the edge of the masonry opening. Upgrade/repairs of these lintels will be required.
3. The plaster finishes at the first-floor level at exterior and interior walls have many cracks. The cracks in the interior walls are due to poor first-floor framing that was propped up by temporary wood posts and beams (see picture #10). The weak first-floor framing caused mayor sags in the first-floor especially at the south half of the house. In addition to the cracks at the plaster finishes of the exterior walls, there are signs of mold and mildew (see picture #11). Due to these conditions, it is my opinion that the entire first-floor be gutted so the exterior masonry walls can be properly repaired and that the framing be upgraded and returned to plumbness (which will most likely include the ceiling and the flat roof framing). I haven’t looked at the roof, but I’m sure it will require a complete tear-off.

4. At the first-floor framing (and assuming similar conditions at the flat roof framing), the floor diaphragm is not connected to the exterior masonry walls (see pictures #13 and #14). The connections between the exterior walls and the floor are crucial to keep the house stable. These deficiencies will have to be addressed by adding bolts and straps. These deficiencies will require the removal of first-floor plaster finishes at the ceiling level.

5. The existing wood rear porch is in very poor condition and needs to be demolished as soon as possible (see picture #14). The foundations for the rear porch are also in poor condition and will have to be replaced (see picture #15).

This structure appears to be in such poor condition that I can’t imagine there is any economic value to try and salvage it.

If you should have any questions, please feel free to contact us.

Sincerely,

Moshe Calamardo & Associates, Inc.
Structural Engineers

Moshe Calamardo, SE, SECB

MCA File#: 118266
Picture #1 – Overall view of the house front (west) and south elevation.

Picture #2 – Front porch at the west side of the house.
Picture #3 – Rear view of the house (east elevation).

Picture #4 – Rear enclosed porch at the southeast corner of the house.
Picture #5 – Efflorescence and deteriorated basement foundation walls (north wall).

Picture #6 – Painted exterior masonry wall (north wall). Note the crack in the wall (arrow).
Picture #7 – Painted exterior masonry walls (north wall). Note the crack in the wall (arrow).

Picture #8 – Framing over window. Note the collapsed wood members (bottom arrow) behind the header in front of the wall (top arrow).
Picture #9 – Framing in front of another window. Note the broken header (arrow).

Picture #10 – Overall view of the basement. Note the many temporary wood posts.
Picture #11 – Mold and mildew at the north wall.

Picture #12 – First floor bearing at the north wall.
No connection was observed between the wood joists and the masonry walls.
Picture #13 – The first-floor joist parallel to the west (and the east) are not connected to each other. Note the gap between the joist and the wall (arrow).

Picture #14 – Rear Porch
Picture #15 – Foundations for the rear porch.
Note the missing portion of the foundation wall (right arrow) and the large crack (left arrow).
Supporting documents
Request for rescission of landmark status for 2305 Brown
Evanston Preservation Commission Meeting
July 10, 2018

Kristin Lems, daughter,
Martha Rosenberg, daughter,
Karima Lems Daoudi, granddaughter
of Carol Lems-Dworkin, owner
2305 Brown

- One story brick house built 1908
- Lot size: 40’ x 125’ (less than ¼ acre)
- House size: 1050 sq. ft.
- Foundation: masonry
- Historic district: none
- Renovations, additions: none
- Central air: no
- Basement too high to allow additional story
1908 application for building permit for one story brick residence - “owner Margaret Fuller, day laborer; builder Henry Butler”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. 3510</th>
<th>Building Permit No. 3580</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APPLICATION FOR BUILDING PERMIT.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TO THE COMMISSIONER OF PUBLIC WORKS: Evanston, Ill., Jan 7, 1908

The undersigned herewith applies for a permit to build a One Story Brick Residence, and hereby agrees upon issuance of said permit to conform to and comply with the conditions of the same and the ordinances of the City of Evanston, so far as they may apply to any work set forth in this application. Same to be located and built in strict accordance with accompanying description, plans and specifications, which are hereby submitted for your approval.

DESCRIPTION

1305 Brown Ave. No. 50 of 8060, LOT 86-67, BLOCK 12.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>On Brown Ave.</th>
<th>Between Grant, Andrew and Cooper</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MATERIALS and COST</th>
<th>DIMENSIONS</th>
<th>FURNISHINGS</th>
<th>SERVICE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No. Cu. yds. Stone</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Width or Front 26</td>
<td>Water Closets 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. Thousands of Brick</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>Length or Depth 43</td>
<td>Sinks 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. Cu. yds. Concrete</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Elevation or Height 14</td>
<td>Bath Tubes 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. Sq. Yards Plastering</td>
<td>800</td>
<td></td>
<td>Laundry Tub.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Cost of Building</td>
<td>1200</td>
<td></td>
<td>Fire Exting.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Heating and Ventilation: 

H3 status only – not A7 - confirmed 1983
Original price point set by conducting realtor poll

- Closed tour and followup poll to 13 Evanston realtors.

- 12 respondents:
  - 3 said $375,000
  - 4 said $350,000
  - 4 said $325,000
  - 1 said $300,000

Decision was made to start at $375,000
### Attempts to sell house

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Price</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5/4/18</td>
<td>$375,000</td>
<td>no offers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5/21/18</td>
<td>$350,000</td>
<td>one offer, withdrawn within 12 hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/26/18</td>
<td>$325,000</td>
<td>no offer by 7/2/18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Potential buyers say too much rehab needed
- to recover costs from resale
- to live comfortably in it
- to recover costs through renting

Restoring house to habitable condition would cost more than the fair market value of the house
Homebase report 5/4 – 6/29

2305 Brown Avenue, Evanston, IL

Provided by Barry Mann
Coldwell Banker Residential Brokerage
(847) 425-3817 | barry.mann@cbexchange.com

Property Detail Views

![Graph showing property detail views](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date Range</th>
<th>ColdwellBankerHomes.com</th>
<th>ColdwellBanker.com</th>
<th>The Zillow Group Websites</th>
<th>Realtor.com</th>
<th>Total Property Detail Views</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6/24/18 - 6/30/18</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>396</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Time</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>3,885</td>
<td>751</td>
<td>4,758</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Text received from realtor explaining lack of interest:

“Even though we are showing the house - it is land that had value - I would have shown for land as well, however, could not do due to landmark status. House needs everything - so people consider for land value”
“The structure appears to be in such poor condition that I can’t imagine there is any economic value to try and salvage it.”

Moshe Calamaro, SE, SECB
June 7, 2018
Carol Lems-Dworkin: Evanston low income senior citizen

• Single mother with several part time jobs – house is sole asset
• Always qualified for senior citizens assessment freeze exemption (income less than $55,000)
• Took 3 different loans from City of Evanston in order to do repairs, always paid on time
• (still owes city $10,000 on last loan, to be paid at sale of house)
State of owner health

• 9/3/17, - age 93, craniotomy for subdural hematoma evacuation (“brain bleed surgery”)

• 10/12/17 - after 6 weeks in rehab, moved to senior rental apartment

• 5/13/18 - fall resulting in broken knee, use of wheelchair, need for 24/7 caregiver

• 6/18/18 – age 94, pacemaker insertion procedure due to total heart block

• Need for round the clock home health care, possible assisted living and/or skilled nursing
monthly assets vs. expenses

Difference: -4,300 per month *

Asset depletion date: March 2019

*assuming independent living with very economical home care; much higher costs for assisted living or skilled nursing

*private view of documentation available upon request
Celebrating 94 at Lincolnwood Place