MEETING MINUTES
EVANSTON PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Tuesday, October 9, 2018,
Lorraine H. Morton Civic Center, 2100 Ridge Avenue, Room 2800
7:00 P.M.

Members Present: Robert Bady, Suzi Reinhold, Jamie Morris, Tim Schmitt, Karl Vogel and Diane Williams

Members Absent: Elliott Dudnik, Julie Hacker, Ken Itle, Sally Riessen Hunt, and Mark Simon,

Staff Present: Carlos Ruiz, Preservation Coordinator

Presiding Member: Diane Williams, Chair

1. CALL TO ORDER / DECLARATION OF QUORUM

Chair Williams called the meeting to order at 7:06 pm with a quorum present.

2. OLD BUSINESS


Fred Wilson from Morgante Wilson Architects presented the application, focusing on standards for construction 1, 2, 3, 4 and 10. He stated the following:

- A 1997 aerial photo shows the former house at 917 Edgemere Ct. that was demolished had a flat roof
- The proposed new house is zoning compliant
- Front façade and materiality, original parapet wall was 33’-6” was lower to 30’-10’
- The front entry bay was 32’, now is 27’
- The lower level was 5’, now is 2’
- The windows now have a vertical orientation to the front façade
- The parapet above the 1-story garage was 20’-8”, now is 19’-8”
- The percentage of glass on the front façade was 20%, now is 15%
• The material is stucco, stone and metal. The spine is for mechanical and becomes a chimney in the back
• The front ‘C’ shaped on the front elevation was removed and replaced with an steel ‘brise soleil.’ The same on the back
• At the rear the structure was lowered 2’
• The AC units on the roof are 15’ off the property line
• The 3D drawings and video animation of the house are a true representation of what will be seen from the street
• A model of the house and adjacent structures showed their relationship and massing and setbacks.
• 956 sf of allowable building lot coverage is not being utilized
• The house is a 4-bedroom home with a 2-car garage on the first floor; dining room, family room, kitchen, and outdoor terrace on the second floor
• The condensers are 17'-8" off the property line. The generator is 10'-4”
• Before and current elevations showed the change of materials, i.e. wood siding replaced with stucco, simplification of the massing, etc.

Garry Shumaker addressed the standards for review of construction:
• 1. Height – the height is reduced to 30'-10" lower than the average height on the block
• 2. Proportion facades – vertical facades, modulation and movement of the front façade and its proportion is more in keeping with the adjacent facades.
• 3. Proportion of openings – The proportions of the windows are vertical and in keeping with the windows on the immediate adjacent houses. The horizontal banding of windows is similar to the adjacent houses
• 4. Rhythm of solids to voids in facades – The house is setback further than the average front yard setback on the block and its immediate north and south neighboring homes
• 5. Rhythm of spacing and structures on streets - The spacing between the structures remains compatible with the rest of the block
• 10. Scale of structure –The width of the lot and the width of the structure on the lot is in keeping with the average lot occupancy of the other structures on the block. The house occupies 80% the front, the house to the south is 79% and the house to the north is 82%. The largest of the lots is 67%.

Sue Sabow, owner, said they worked hard over the past months and years with their team. They believed they have addressed all the points that were raised by the Commission at the last meeting.

Public Comment:
Chair Williams acknowledged a communication from William Goldstein of 940 Edgemere Ct. opposing the proposed house.

Harry Lowrance of 919 Edgemere Ct. showed on a model the proposed house saying it is still too high and too massive. It is at least 10’ higher than the former house.
Jackie Crihfield of 911 Edgemere stated the house will be the second largest house on the narrowest lot. The size, the height, and the mass have not been sufficiently addressed.

Joan Rosenberg of 901 Edgemere Ct. expressed concern with the short and long term impact on her neighborhood, building such a large house, although a beautiful house.

Pauline Sheehan of 920 Edgemere Ct. complemented the design team for greatly improving the design of the house. However, it is on a 5’ basement. The mass of the house is still too high. There is still room to lower the basemen and floor to floor heights.

Phillip Crihfield of 911 Edgemere Ct. said the project relies on a faulty zoning analysis. It does not have visual compatibility with the properties, sites to which is visually related. It should be looked in its totality to its neighbors. The house is be visible from Clark Park, which is a public way.

Doug Gilbert, representing the Edgemere Ct. Neighbors, said the design is an improvement. However, the height is still an issue compared to eave lines of the neighboring houses, roof ridge lines and parapets of adjacent houses.

Fred Wilson emphasized that their representation of the house is accurate.

**Commission's discussion:**
Commissioner Vogel said despite all the improvements, the house is still large.

Commissioner Schmitt asked about Clark Park and Lake Michigan whether they considered public way. Chair Williams referred to the Preservation Ordinance confirming that the public way does not include Lake Michigan.

Commissioner Bady said it is a narrow lot, and the design team could not have done anything better and he appreciated how significantly the height and mass have been reduced. He would probably say yes (for approval).

Commissioner Reinhold said that her suggestions made at the last meeting had been addressed, reducing significantly the height, changing proportions, and adjusting the front, so it looks more appropriate from the street/public way. These improvements met her requirements.

Johanna Leonard, Community Development Director, in respect to Clark Park, said that according to the Law Department, Clark Park is not a thoroughfare; so it is not considered a public way.

Commissioner Reinhold moved to issue a COA to 917 Edgemere Ct. for the construction on a vacant lot of a new 2-story stone and stucco single family residence with a 2-car attached garage. Applicable standards include construction 1-11, 13, 14
and 16, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed 4 ayes, 2 nays (Vogel and Schmitt).

B. 90 Kedzie St. (LSHD) – Claire Kettelkamp, applicant. Install a 6-foot wood fence around the side and rear yards of the property, observing the utility easement along the south property line. This would include a fence in the front yard, which is not permitted under City Code 6-4-6-7. A variance has been granted by the Zoning Board of Appeals to allow a 42" fence with 52" masonry piers in the front yard. Please refer to attached Final Determination Letter, dated August 27, 2018. The front yard portion would be a 42" high metal fence with 52" masonry piers located at the NW corner of the property, continuing along on the north property line, terminating on the east side of the driveway for a total run of 105 linear feet. Applicable standards: [Construction 1, 4, 5, 7, 9, 10, 12 and 13] Continued from 6/12/2018.

Matt Rodgers and Claire Kettlekamp presented the application noting that:
- They received approval for and installed a temporary chain link fence and a 6' H wood fence across the lot - to the right of the house – the wood fence is not secured to the ground.
- The temporary fence is due to be removed in November 2018
- The proposal is to permanently install a 6' wood fence on the side and rear lot lines with landscaping. The wood fence will not be seen from the public right of way
- The front yard fence is 42" in height iron fence between 52” high masonry piers of salvaged brick, as approved by the Zoning Board of Appeals (ZBA)
- There will be a short iron fence along the Lake to meet pool code.

Commissioner Schmitt moved to issue a COA for the property at 90 Kedzie St., in that the standards for construction 1, 4, 5, 7, 9, 10, 12 and 13 have been met. The fence height has been approved by ZBA. The front lanterns should be in more scale with the property, seconded by Commissioner Morris. The motion passed 5-0 with one abstention (Bady).

C. 834 Madison St. (L) – Tim Daisy, applicant. Replace selected first and second floor double hung wood windows with double hung Fibrex windows. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-3, 5, 6, 9 and 10] Continued from 9/11/2018. Applicant has requested to continue the application until further notice.

Commissioner Bady made a motion to continue 834 Madison St. to January 8, 2019, seconded by Commissioner Schmitt. The motion passed 6-0.

3. NEW BUSINESS

A. 1047 Forest Av. (L/LSHD) – Steve Liska, applicant. A new front door with sidelights, several new windows in new locations, change wood siding to paneling at a portion of the south east bay, install metal roof canopy with brackets at the rear entrance, and new
wood storm/screen windows at all double hung windows. Applicable Standards: [Alteration 1-10].

Bret Gadson, owner and Steve Liska, architect presented the application as follows:
- The house had a fire last November 2017.
- Replacing front door, various windows around the house, new paneling at the southeast bay and wood storm windows all around the house, new double hung windows and a canopy above the rear entrance.

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to issue a COA for the project at 1047 Forest Avenue, the standards for alteration 1-10 have been met, and that the panel size (second floor) on the east elevation, be more in keeping with the existing windows size, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed 6-0.

**B. 2215 Orrington Av. (NEHD)** - Paul Janicki, applicant. Revisions to previously approved plans: East Elevation Comparison: reduced number of windows from 3 to 2 on the upper left hand corner and 4 to 3 on the lower right-hand corner. Also added basement windows now that we have full basement, not crawlspace. Also reduced French door from a pair to a single. North Elevation Comparison: Added basement window and bulkhead. South Elevation Comparison: No changes except new basement windows. Applicable Standards: [Alteration 1-10].

Paul Janicki presented the application. The Commission previously approved the demolition of a rear addition and the construction of a new addition. Since then revisions have been made as follows:
- The project has now under the addition a basement with windows
- East elevation – a pair of French doors to one door, four windows kitchen windows are now three windows, and on the second floor master bathroom, three windows are now two windows
- North elevation - first floor basement window and bulkhead added
- South elevation – two basement windows added; stairs to basement eliminated, and piers the stairs landing added.

Commissioner Bady made a motion to issue a COA for 2215 Orrington for the revisions including adding basement windows and bulkhead; standards for alteration 1-10 are met, seconded by Commissioner Reinhold. The motion passed 6-0.

**C. 704 Judson Av. (L/LSHD)** Garry Shumaker, applicant. Revisions to previously approved plans: Relocate the existing front porch side stairs to the front of the porch for direct access to main entry door, and reduce screened front porch area. Applicable Standards: [Alteration 1-10].

Garry Shumaker presented the application for revisions to a previously approved project:
• East elevation – rotating the front entry stairs with wing walls (with shiplap siding) and metal railings, uncovering the front entry to the house and enclosing half of the front screen porch
• Direct entrance to the front porch with bluestone pavers, and creating access to the south side of the house

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to issue a COA for 704 Judson Av. for the revisions to the previously approved plans, to relocate the existing front porch stairs to the center; the standards for alteration 1-10 are met, seconded by Commissioner Morris. The motion passed 6-0.

D. 913 Monroe St. (L) - Garry Shumaker, applicant. Replace 18 windows selected non-original windows with new Pella Architects series “reserve” line windows to match the existing windows style with no muntins. Applicable Standards: [Alteration 1-10].

Garry Shumaker presented the application to replace eighteen existing insert windows:
• Original windows were replaced 10-12 years ago with Weather Shield inserts
• The jam liners and jam pockets were not insulated, the sashes and stops were removed and replacement windows inserted
• Replace the windows with Pella Architects “reserve” line windows with a clad exterior. The newer existing casement window is not being replaced
• The new windows are full replacement windows. There are no original windows on the house.
• The north dormer windows will not be replaced. The stairwell casement windows will be replaced
• The front non-original shutters will be removed
• The front door will be refurbished

Commissioner Reinhold made a motion to issue a COA for 913 Monroe St. to replace eighteen non-original windows with the new Pella Architectural ‘reserve’ series; standards for alteration 1-10 are met, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed 6-0.

E. 2125 Sherman Av. – Noreen Edwards, applicant. Demolish existing detached garage and construct new 2-car detached wood frame garage. Applicable Standards: [Construction 1-5, 7, 8, 10-14, and 16]; and [Demolition 1-6]

Noreen Edwards and Mark Metz, owners, presented the application as follows:
• Demolish existing 20’x20’ garage and construct a 24’x27” wood frame garage
• The new man door will exit to the rear yard
• The exterior materials are vinyl siding, vinyl windows, and asphalt shingles for the roof

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to issue a COA for 2125 Sherman Av. for the demolition of the existing detached garage and the construction detached 2-car garage, in that standards for construction 1-5, 7, 8, 10-14, and 16, and demolition 1-6 are met
and the garage eaves should not be larger than the house eaves, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed 6-0.

F. 1426 Forest Av. (LSHD) – Brent Widler, applicant. Construction of a 2nd story addition over existing one-story addition at rear of house and an open porch on the first floor. Exterior alterations: Repair, replacement and addition of windows on the east, north, west and south elevations. Repair and replacement of wood siding on all elevations. Front porch: Replace roof and cornice, barrel vault with bead ceiling. Replace: corona, frieze with bed molding, 6” column covers. New: wrought iron railings, and cladding over existing concrete steps. Demolition of existing detached garage and construction of new 2-car detached wood frame garage. Applicable Standards: [Alteration 1-10]; [Construction 1- 5, 7, 8, 10-14, and 15]; and [Demolition 1-6]

Brent Widler presented the application as follows:
- From the 1892 design, the front porch was recessed four feet. The existing front porch was added
- A second story addition master suite is proposed above the existing single-story addition
- All the windows on the first floor of the front elevation have been previously replaced. The remaining original wood windows are beyond repair
- All the windows will be replaced with a Pella ‘reserve’ line (double hung and casements), with exception of the windows in the dormers on the attic level, as well as 3-panel windows
- The existing non- original front porch canopy will be replaced and the columns will be fitted with new covers to be more historically accurate in proportion and detail. Also a new asphalt shingle roof over the canopy will be installed
- The second story proposed rear addition mimics the roof line of the existing addition. Also adding a mudroom and a back porch
- The existing cut wood siding detail on the north and south elevations will be removed
- The fire place and chimney on the south elevation will be removed
- Demolish the existing 20’x20’garage and construct a 24’x28’ garage with the same detailing as the existing garage
- New windows have an ogee profile and 1x4 clad trim and sill to match the existing

Chair Williams asked about the blank walls on the south elevation and Commissioner Reinhold asked about the muntin pattern on the second floor double hung window, the muntin patterns on the original windows, and the trim to be cladded.

Commissioner Reinhold made a motion to issue a COA for 1426 Forest Av. for the construction of a second-story addition over an existing one-story addition at the rear of the house and an open porch on the first floor. Exterior alterations include repair, replacement and addition of windows on the east, north, west, and south elevations; with the window on the north elevation, second floor, to become a 12/12 double hung
window, repair and replacement of the wood siding on all elevations and replace roof and cornice barrel vault and ceiling at the front porch, and the new wrought iron railings and cladding over the concrete steps. It also includes the demolition of the existing detached garage and construction of a new two-car detached wood frame garage. Applicable standards include: alteration 1-10; construction 1-5, 7, 8, 10-14, and 15; and demolition 1-6, seconded by Commissioner Morris. The motion passed 6-0.

G. 1222 Dryden Place. (RHD) – William James, applicant. Construction of a new two-story single family house with attached garage on the vacant lot at 1222 Dryden Place, with adjoining lot to the east used as yard and open space. Applicable Standards: [Construction 1-14 and 16]

William James and Nate Kipnis presented the application as follows:

- The lot sizes on the development are awkward, making it difficult for a decent yard along Dempster St. Also, prospective buyers prefer a contemporary design
- The eastern most lot (1222 Dryden Pl.) is used for the house, and the lot to the west (1232 Dryden Pl.) is used for the larger yard area
- The floor plan works with the landscape plan and the yard area to the west, with a patio adjoining the west wall of the house, and a water wall sculptural element
- The design is contemporary ‘Post Modern’ where different planes of the building are clad in different types of materials and it creates a very geometric style
- The front door is along the west wall along the north side of the building, also two points of egress, one for the dining room and one for the kitchen
- The garage faces north with a driveway for movement in and out of the garage. There are two additional parking space
- The 2nd floor has four bedrooms, three baths, and a roof terrace facing north
- The basement has below grade windows facing south and a retaining wall along the south elevation
- The facades building materials are a combination of wood planks, natural set dry stone, metal and fiber board panels, and aluminum for overhangs, soffits, and windows surrounds clad in aluminum. The materials are on different planes of the building creating a mix of textures
- The south elevation has a projecting 2-foot bay clad in aluminum
- The landscape plan screens Dempster St., provides a lawn area on the west side of the property, a patio adjacent to the building on the west side. Dryden Pl. to the north is part of the lot area
- Dryden Pl. is an easement for utilities, it would be difficult to position the house in a way that crosses that easement
- The building is 5’ setback on the west lot and 5’ setback on the east section. The building is 5’ from the split. The building can stand away by itself from the two lots. Zoning made it clear that the lots could not be split. There is no desire to file a consolidation. If it were to be split, there will be some non-conformities created with respect to lot coverage and other things
- The project is under maximum impervious surface and is zoning compliant
Public Comment:
Randy Smith of 1212 Dryden Pl. said even though City staff says the proposal is zoning compliant by considering both lots together, yet the application makes it very clear that these are two separate lots in the definition of parcels to PINs. They are described in the application as two zoning lots, suggesting they are separate entities. If the building were confined to only 1222 Dryden Pl. lot, it will not comply with zoning requirements. The house is 15% bigger than any other single family houses in the subdivision on similar size lots.

Carlos Ruiz said according to Zoning staff, if the lots were separated, the lot coverage would be 31% and impervious surface would be 55%. They could not move the west property line on the east lot, because the west lot would become non-compliant.

Chair Williams had concerns about the materiality, not the design. There seems to be a lot of materials competing on all of the facades. They could be simplified. The Commission has no issues with contemporary or innovative design.

Commissioner Reinhold said she has not heard any conversation of how the proposed building relates to the buildings next to it. The building needs to be a home that respects the context that is in (Ridge Historic District). The houses to the east and west have a very strong rhythm of punched windows, unlike the proposed house.

Commissioner Vogel said the design needs to refine the building materials. Chair Williams said the materials should be simplified and streamlined and address the relationship of materials and textures, concern about the openings and how they relate, the rhythm of solids to voids. Innovative design has to be compatible with the entities around it in size, color material, character neighborhood and the environment.

Commissioner Bady made a motion to continue 1222 Dryden Pl. to November 13, 2018, seconded by Commissioner Vogel. The motion passed 6-0.


Commissioner Bady made a motion to approve the July 10, September 5 and September 11, 2018, seconded by Commissioner Reinhold. The motion passed 6-0.

5. STAFF REPORTS

Chair Williams said the City Council approved last night that the Commission can visit Harley Clarke. Two Commissioners could visit at a time.

6. DISCUSSION (No vote will be taken)

7. ADJOURNMENT
Commissioner Vogel made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 10:35 pm on 10/9/2018, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed 6-0.

Respectfully Submitted,

Carlos D. Ruiz
Senior Planner/Preservation Coordinator