MEETING MINUTES
EVANSTON PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Tuesday, December 11, 2018,
Lorraine H. Morton Civic Center, 2100 Ridge Avenue, Room 2800
7:00 P.M.

Members Present: Robert Bady, Ken Itle, Jamie Morris, Suzi Reinhold, Tim Schmitt, and Mark Simon,

Members Absent: Elliott Dudnik, Sally Riessen Hunt, Julie Hacker, Karl Vogel and Diane Williams

Staff Present: Scott Mangum, Planning & Zoning Administrator
Carlos D. Ruiz, Preservation Coordinator

Presiding Member: Ken Itle, Vice-Chair

1. CALL TO ORDER / DECLARATION OF QUORUM 7:03 pm

Vice Chair Ken Itle called the meeting to order at 7:03 pm, with a quorum of six Commissioners present.

2. OLD BUSINESS

A. 1222 Dryden Place. (RHD) – William James, applicant. Construction of a new two-story single family house with attached garage on the vacant lot at 1222 Dryden Place, with adjoining lot to the east used as yard and open space. Applicable Standards: [Construction 1-14 and 16]). [TO BE CONTINUED TO 1/8/2019]

Commissioner Bady made a motion to continue 1222 Dryden Place to the January 8, 2019 Preservation Commission meeting, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed 6-0.

B. 1210 Michigan Av. (L/LSHD) – Michelle Beck, applicant. Construction of a 20’x20’ detached garage in the interior south side yard. Requires minor zoning variation. 6-4-6-3: Detached accessory structure not permitted within interior side yards (between the side property line and the principal building); garage proposed to be located within the south interior side yard. 6-4-6-2 Detached accessory structures required to be located 10’ from the principal structure; 5’ separation proposed. Applicable standards: [Construction 1-5, 7-13 and 16]; [Minor Zoning variation A and C]. [TO BE CONTINUED TO 1/8/2019]
Commissioner Reinhold made a motion to continue 1210 Michigan Av. to the January 8, 2019 Preservation Commission meeting, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed 6-0.

C. 1239 Asbury Av. (L/RHD) – Valerie Romanov, applicant. Remove existing main roof and raise the second floor exterior walls 2’ to create additional height for attic space, then construct new gable roof to match the existing roof with one dormer on the front west elevation and one or two dormers on the rear east elevation. Restore/replace parts of rotten wood siding as needed, materials to match original wood siding. Replace broken attic windows on the east and west elevations and materials of the existing attic windows on the south and north elevation. Applicable Standards: [Alteration 1-10]; [Construction 1- 4, 7, 8, 10-12 and 15]. [TO BE CONTINUED TO 1/8/2019]

Commissioner Morris made a motion to continue 1239 Asbury Ave. to the January 8, 2019 Preservation Commission meeting, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed 6-0.

3. NEW BUSINESS

A. 419 Keeney St. (LSHD) – Patti Capouch, applicant. Replace non-original vinyl windows with aluminum clad wood windows. Replace rear porch entry metal doors in kind. Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-10]

Jane Sloss, architect, presented the application on behalf of Impact Behavioral Partners, an organization that provides housing, employment and clinical services for adults with mental illness. This is one of six buildings being renovated across Evanston, funded by the Illinois Department of Housing and the Housing Authority.

The project is for the replacement of existing vinyl windows and the rear insulated steel doors. An existing stained glass window will not be replaced. The existing double hung vinyl windows will be replaced with Pella Architect series, aluminum clad wood windows (similar to the original wood windows including the profile). The existing insulated steel doors will be replaced with Thermatru insulated steel doors.

Chair Itle asked if the applicants had seen any historic photos of the building before the vinyl windows went in. J. Sloss said they don’t have any historic photos of the building.

Commissioner Reinhold made a motion to issue a COA to 419 Keeney St. for the replacement of non-original vinyl windows with aluminum clad wood windows, and the replacement of the rear porch entry doors. Applicable standards include alteration 1-10, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed 6-0.

B. 1208 Florence Av. (L) - Jennifer Cross, applicant. Modify opening at existing single window at front of home with new double window. Replace 2 existing window openings at side of home with 2 new windows of equal width and height. Add new
single window at living room to make double windows. Modify second floor window are side of home with new transom style window. New window to have aluminum clad exterior (Pella Brick red) with mullion patterns to match as close as possible (where necessary). Applicable standards: [Alteration 1-10]  

Jennifer Cross presented the application, including the replacement of one double hung single window on the first floor of the front east elevation to become a double window (two windows of the same size) with similar (12/1) mullion pattern, North side elevation, first floor - a single double hung window will become a double window, same size and (12/1) mullion pattern, and one double hung window will be replaced with a window, similar size and mullion pattern (from 12/1 to 9/1); a third double hung window is being replaced with a larger window (9/1), and replacing the double hung window with a transom window on the second floor dormer. Rear west elevation, first floor, one casement window replaced in kind and two second story double hung windows will be also replaced. South elevation second floor dormer, replace two double hung windows. All replacement windows are Pella Architect series aluminum clad wood windows, with the simulated divided lights when existing.  

Commissioner Simon asked what material are the existing windows. George Paul, owner, said the majority of the existing windows are not original and are aluminum clad wood windows. J. Cross said the original wood windows are not being replaced.  

Commissioner Simon asked why replacing rather than repairing the windows? J. Cross said is more about the consistency and the look and having those meld together, keeping a similar ratio of height and width, trying to add more light to the front of the home, and for energy efficiency.  

Commissioner Schmitt asked about changing the mullion pattern from 12/1 to 9/1 on two windows on the north elevation. J. Cross it was done to keep the same ratio, for those two windows to match, because they are on the same plane and room inside the house. Regarding to front elevation, Commissioner Simon said the double window seems to be a reasonable effort to let in more light, the appearance looks pretty similar.  

Vice-Chair Itle said the change to the front façade and doubling up the downstairs window detracts from the original Cottage style, by giving emphasis to the double window in the gable upstairs and keeping the first floor somewhat smaller. It loses something when doubling that first floor window on the front. Also, introducing the 9/1 window pattern, when it does not exist on the house at all on the north side. Since everything else is 1/1, he would prefer 1/1 replacement windows instead. The idea is to create some consistency.  

Commissioner Simon said the standards call for minimal alteration as possible. He asked what justifies the exterior alteration. J. Cross said the double window is for more light and is consistent with the ratio, the width and the height. It is more about the owners feeling comfortable in their new space.
Commissioner Simon made a motion to approve the COA for 1208 Florence Av. for modifying the existing single window at the front into a new double window, replace two existing window openings at the side with two new windows of equal width and height, add new single window at living room to make double windows, modify second floor window to a transom style window, and all the windows will be Pella Architect series with aluminum clad exterior, in accordance to applicable standards for alteration 1-10, seconded by Commissioner Morris. The motion passed 5 ayes, 1 nay (Commissioner Itle)

C. Election of Preservation Commission’s 2019 Officers

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion for electing Mark Simon as Chair, Ken Itle as Vice-Chair and Elliott Dudnik as Secretary as the 2019 Preservation Commissioner Officers, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed 6-0.

4. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES of October 23 and November 13, 2018.

Commissioners and staff discussed the content and the length of meeting minutes. Scott Mangum said except for unique cases, and since meetings are being recorded, the City wide policy is for action minutes, rather than detailed minutes.

Commissioner Simon said, for example for the November 13, 2018 minutes, having a three sentence summary and then the action taken would have been better. Commissioner Bady made a motion to approve the October 23, 2018 special meeting minutes, with corrections on page 7 (removing a side note from staff), seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 5-0 and 1 abstention (Commissioner Reinhold).

Commissioner Simon said that a 90 minute discussion about the Harley Clarke Mansion among Commissioners was not reflected in the November 13, 2018 meetings. Commissioners agreed to add a lead sentence about the discussion before the taken action. Commissioner Reinhold made a motion to approve the November 13, 2018 minutes with the change to put a summary about the lengthy discussion for the Harley Clarke Mansion, seconded by Commissioner Simon. The motion passed. Vote: 6-0.

5. STAFF REPORTS

Carlos Ruiz reported that the City Council decided not to pursue the demolition of the Harley Clarke Mansion. Scott Mangum said City Council did not accept the appeal.

The CAMP workshop will take place in Evanston through a Certified Local Government Grant. The workshop will be in the spring of 2019 on a Friday. The maximum number of attendants is 30. The City of Highland Park Preservation Commission and staff are interested in attending the workshop.

As a side note, Commissioners expressed interest in having a social gathering for the end of the year holidays. In the absence of five Commissioners this could be brought back for discussion in January 2019.
6. **DISCUSSION** (No vote will be taken)

No discussion

7. **ADJOURNMENT**

Commissioner Schmitt made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 7:52 pm, seconded by Commissioner Bady. The motion passed 6-0.

Respectfully submitted,

Carlos D. Ruiz  
Preservation Coordinator